

# TRANSCRIPT OF RECORD.

---

SUPREME COURT OF THE UNITED STATES.

OCTOBER TERM, 1898.

No. 269.

---

THE ADDYSTON PIPE AND STEEL COMPANY, DENNIS  
LONG & CO., HOWARD-HARRISON IRON COMPANY,  
ANNISTON PIPE AND FOUNDRY COMPANY, SOUTH  
PETERSBURG PIPE WORKS, AND CHATTANOOGA FOUN-  
DRY AND PIPE WORKS, APPELLANTS,

vs.

THE UNITED STATES.

---

APPEAL FROM THE UNITED STATES CIRCUIT COURT OF APPEALS  
FOR THE SIXTH CIRCUIT.

---

FILED MARCH 28, 1898.

(16,833.)

(16,833.)

SUPREME COURT OF THE UNITED STATES.

OCTOBER TERM, 1908.

No. 269.

THE ADDYSTON PIPE AND STEEL COMPANY, DENNIS  
LONG & CO., HOWARD-HARRISON IRON COMPANY,  
ANNISTON PIPE AND FOUNDRY COMPANY, SOUTH  
PITTSBURG PIPE WORKS, AND CHATTANOOGA FOUN-  
DRY AND PIPE WORKS, APPELLANTS,

*vs.*

THE UNITED STATES.

APPEAL FROM THE UNITED STATES CIRCUIT COURT OF APPEALS  
FOR THE SIXTH CIRCUIT.

INDEX.

	Original.	Print.
Transcript from the circuit court of the United States for the eastern district of Tennessee.....	1	1
1. Caption.....	1	1
Petition.....	2	1
Subpoena to Dennis Long & Co.....	12	10
Marshal's return.....	13	11
Subpoena to Adlyston Pipe and Steel Co.....	13	11
Marshal's return.....	14	11
Subpoena to Howard-Harrison Iron Co. <i>et al.</i> .....	14	11
Marshal's return.....	15	12
Subpoena to South Pittsburg Pipe Works <i>et al.</i> .....	15	12
Marshal's return.....	16	13
Order to file petition, &c.....	10	14
Restraining order.....	17	14

	Original.	Print.
Marshal's return.....	18	15
Restraining order.....	18	15
Marshal's return.....	19	16
Restraining order.....	20	16
Marshal's return.....	21	17
Restraining order.....	21	16
Marshal's return.....	22	19
Notice to defendants to produce books, &c.....	22	19
Order continuing hearing of motion for injunction.....	25	21
Notice to defendants to produce documents, &c.....	25	21
Notice to defendants to produce documents, &c.....	27	23
Notice to defendants to produce documents, &c.....	29	24
Denurrer and answer.....	30	25
Statement as to location of shops, &c.....	44	36
Affidavit of Martin Manion.....	45	37
Exhibit A—Letter of the Chattanooga Foundry and Pipe Works to Manion & Co., January 21, 1895.....	48	40
Letter of the Chattanooga Foundry and Pipe Works to L. H. Gardner, March 8, 1895.....	48	40
C—Letter of C. W. Harrison to Manion & Co., May 10, 1895.....	49	41
Letter of R. E. Craig to Manion & Co., March 15, 1895.....	50	42
Letter of Thomasson to M. Manion, February 23, 1895.....	51	42
D—Letter of R. D. Wood & Co. to the New Or- leans Water Co., March 11, 1895.....	51	43
Affidavit of Cephas M. Brown.....	52	46
Extracts from the minutes of the board of commis- sioners of Atlanta, Ga.....	53	47
Affidavit of James H. Bible.....	61	52
R. P. Gettys.....	61	52
Letter, Knoxville Woolen Mills to Chattanooga Foundry and Pipe Works, April 25, 1896.....	62	53
Letter, Chattanooga Foundry and Pipe Works to Knox Woolen Mills, April 29, 1896.....	63	54
Letter, Knoxville Woolen Mills to Howard-Harrison Ir Co., April 25, 1896.....	63	55
Letter, F. B. Nichols to Knoxville Woolen Mills, April 30, 1896.....	63	54
Affidavit of Emory S. Foster.....	64	54
Exhibit A—Abstract of proposals for furnishing and de- livering water pipe, St. Louis water depart- ment, August 22, 1893.....	65	55
B—Abstract of proposals for water pipe, St. Louis water department, September 12, 1893.....	66	56
C—Abstract of proposals for water pipe, St. Louis water department, August 7, 1894.....	66	56
D—Abstract of proposals for water pipe, St. Louis water department, September 17, 1895.....	67	57
E—Abstract of proposals for water pipe, St. Louis water department, February 4, 1896.....	67	57

INDEX.

111

	Original.	Print.
Exhibit F—Abstract of proposals for water pipe, St. Louis water department, July 28, 1896. . . . .	67	57
G—Abstract of proposals for water pipe, St. Louis water department, October 6, 1896. . . . .	68	58
H—Abstract of proposals for water pipe, St. Louis water department, October 6, 1896. . . . .	68	58
Affidavit of J. E. McClure. . . . .	69	59
Exhibit A—Minutes of Associated Pipe Works, December 28, 1894. . . . .	75	64
By-laws adopted January 23, 1895. . . . .	79	67
Minutes of Associated Pipe Works, May 16, 1895. . . . .	81	69
Minutes of Associated Pipe Works, December 19, 20, 1895. . . . .	84	72
Minutes of Associated Pipe Works, February 14, 1896. . . . .	87	74
Minutes of Associated Pipe Works, March 13, 1896. . . . .	89	76
B—Telegram, Haughton to Llewellyn, December 21, 1894. . . . .	91	77
Letter, Haughton to Llewellyn, Jan. 2, 1895. . . . .	91	77
Telegram, Llewellyn to Harrison <i>et al.</i> , January 1, 1895. . . . .	91	78
Letter, Llewellyn to Bessemer <i>et al.</i> , January 1, 1895. . . . .	92	79
Letter, Nichols to Anniston Co. <i>et al.</i> , January 24, 1896. . . . .	93	79
Statement of pipe shipped St. Louis, &c. . . . .	94	80
Telegram, Chattanooga Works to Long & Co. <i>et al.</i> , April 29, 1896. . . . .	96	82
Letter, Nichols to Thomasson, Dec. 23, 1895. . . . .	96	82
Meeting of Associated Pipe Works, December 19, 1895. . . . .	96	82
C—Letter, Chattanooga Works to Dimmick, February 15, 1896. . . . .	97	82
Letter, Dimmick to Chattanooga Works <i>et al.</i> , February 15, 1896. . . . .	97	83
Letter, Chattanooga Works to Woodard, February 17, 1896. . . . .	98	83
Letter, Tarbelt to Chattanooga Works, February 19, 1896. . . . .	98	83
Letter, Chattanooga Works to Anniston Co., February 21, 1896. . . . .	98	83
Telegram, Anniston Co. to Chattanooga Works, February 21, 1896. . . . .	99	84
Letter, Dimmick to Nichols, February 24, 1896. . . . .	99	84
Letter, Varner to Anniston Co., Feb. 24, 1896. . . . .	100	85
Letter, Chattanooga Works to Dimmick, February 25, 1896. . . . .	102	86
Letter, Chattanooga Works to Dimmick, February 26, 1896. . . . .	103	87

	Original.	Print.
Exhibit D—Letter, Chattanooga Works to Thornton, January 3, 1896.....	104	88
Telegram, Chattanooga Works to Wood, April 14, 1896.....	104	88
Telegram, Chattanooga Works to Wood, April 15, 1896.....	104	88
Letter, Llewellyn to Thornton, April 4, 1896..	104	88
Telegram, Llewellyn to Thomason, April 10, 1896..	105	89
Letter, Chattanooga Works to Finkle, April 18, 1896.....	105	89
Telegram, Chattanooga Works to Wood, April 1, 1896.....	106	89
Letter, Chattanooga Works to Garlin's Sons, April 27, 1896.....	106	90
Telegram, Chattanooga Works to Solvay Co., April 29, 1896.....	106	90
Telegram, Llewellyn to Wood, March 27, 1896..	107	90
E—Letter, Haughton to Llewellyn, Dec. 28, 1895..	107	90
Letter, Llewellyn to Harrison, Feb. 20, 1896..	109	92
Letter, Chattanooga Works to Flint, January 2, 1896.....	110	93
F—Letter, Llewellyn to all shops.....	112	95
Letter, Llewellyn to South Pittsburg Works..	112	95
Telegram, Llewellyn to Long & Co.....	113	95
Telegram, Llewellyn to South Pittsburg Works..	113	95
Letter, Llewellyn to all shops, Feb. 28, 1896..	113	95
Telegram, Llewellyn to Dintnick.....	114	96
Letter, Llewellyn to ———.....	114	96
Telegram, Llewellyn to Harrison.....	115	96
Telegram, Llewellyn to Anniston Co.....	115	96
Telegram, Llewellyn to Long & Co.....	115	97
Telegram, Llewellyn to Long & Co. <i>et al.</i> .....	115	97
Telegram, Llewellyn to Anniston Co. <i>et al.</i> .....	115	97
Telegram, Llewellyn to Wood.....	115	97
Telegram, Llewellyn to all shops.....	115	97
Telegram, Llewellyn to Harrison.....	116	97
G—General statement, January 1 to April 15, 1896..	116	98
Letter, Chattanooga Works to Howard-Harrison Co.....	117	99
Letter, Chattanooga Works to Howard-Harrison Co., March 17, 1896.....	118	99
Letter, Chattanooga Works to Howard-Harrison Co., March 30, 1896.....	118	99
Letter, Chattanooga Works to Howard-Harrison Co., April 15, 1896.....	118	100
Letter, Chattanooga Works to Howard-Harrison Co., April 28, 1896.....	118	100
Letter, Llewellyn to Anniston Co. <i>et al.</i> , January 31, 1896.....	119	100
Letter, Llewellyn to Thornton, April 4, 1896..	119	100
Letter, Llewellyn to Thornton.....	119	101

INDEX.

v

	Original.	Print.
Exhibit H—Letter, South Pittsburg Works to Miller, April 13, 1896.....	120	101
Letter, Chattanooga Works to Flint, April 15, 1896.....	121	101
Letter, Chattanooga Works to South Pittsburg Works, April 28, 1896.....	121	101
Letter, Harrison to Chattanooga Works April 20, 1896.....	122	102
Letter, Chattanooga Works to Bierbower, April 20, 1896.....	122	103
Affidavit of H. D. Hallett.....	123	103
George C. Morgan.....	124	104
F. A. W. Davis.....	125	105
R. E. Dickey.....	126	106
Peter Moran.....	127	107
W. H. Garrett.....	128	108
August Herrmann.....	131	110
Casper Chisohu.....	132	111
R. B. McKenzie.....	133	111
Exhibit—Copy of advertisement for proposals for water works at Eufaula, Alabama.....	133	112
Instructions to bidders.....	134	112
Form of proposal.....	136	114
Form of contract, &c.....	142	119
Affidavit of E. L. Bierbower.....	173	143
Exhibit A—Letter, J. E. McClure to Elias Bierbower.....	174	144
B—Letter, E. M. Dolson, April 29, 1896.....	175	145
C—Letter, J. E. McClure to Ellis L. Bierbower, October 12, 1896.....	175	145
D—Letter, J. E. McClure to E. L. Bierbower, December 23, 1896.....	177	146
E—Statement of pipe bought.....	177	147
Affidavit of A. C. Overholt.....	178	147
W. E. Clow.....	180	149
Letter, Board of Public Works and Affairs of Nashville to South Pittsburg Pipe Works, January 22, 1897.....	182	150
Affidavit of James Murphy.....	182	151
M. F. Loughman.....	183	152
G. M. Hanson.....	184	152
T. W. Snow.....	185	153
James P. Shortall.....	186	154
Oliver Phelps.....	187	155
W. S. Kuhn.....	189	157
James Bowron.....	192	159
C. F. Burke.....	196	162
H. E. McWane.....	196	164
Park Woodward.....	200	166
H. C. Erwin.....	202	167
Exhibit A—Report of committee of investigation to board of water commissioners of Atlanta, Georgia, September 1, 1896.....	205	169
Affidavit of C. C. Ferguson.....	210	174
Letter, J. E. McClure to superintendent of Booneville Water Co., May 16, 1896.....	211	175

	Original	Print
Affidavit of Joseph W. Blabon.....	212	176
C. W. Harrison.....	214	177
John Canefield.....	218	180
D. M. Allen.....	220	182
John Martin.....	221	183
A. N. Denman.....	224	185
H. N. Wade.....	225	186
James Walsh.....	227	188
James P. Donahue.....	228	189
W. H. Dillingham.....	230	190
John W. Rodgers.....	232	192
A. F. Callahan.....	233	193
A. W. Walton.....	235	194
Exhibit to answer—Statement of M. L. Holman.....	237	196
Copies of the minutes of the board of public works and affairs of Nashville, Tennessee.....	239	198
Affidavit of M. Llewellyn.....	242	200
F. B. Nichols.....	248	204
Alexander Ross.....	248	205
E. C. Fuller.....	249	205
J. A. Brockhoff.....	251	207
Herman Erdman and Louis Winkleman.....	252	208
Warren Case.....	253	209
George W. Morris.....	254	210
F. M. Cappelén.....	258	211
G. Jaeger.....	257	212
A. H. Davidson.....	258	213
Duncan Jones.....	259	214
H. M. Lofton.....	260	215
Louis Z. Baya.....	261	215
A. F. Callahan.....	262	216
E. S. Gaylord.....	263	220
J. K. Dimmick.....	267	221
Exhibit A—List of cast-iron pipe companies in the United States.....	270	223
Affidavit of John A. Moody.....	270	223
M. N. Woodruff.....	272	225
Nesbitt Wingfield.....	274	226
J. W. Thomas, Jr.....	274	227
Howard Neely.....	276	229
Charles R. Long.....	278	230
T. B. Livingstone.....	279	231
Alexander Ross.....	280	232
John M. Healy.....	280	233
George O. Knapp.....	281	234
A. W. Milligan.....	285	235
Jo. C. Guild.....	285	236
T. J. Bronson.....	286	237
J. W. Byrnes.....	287	238
David A. Thatcher.....	288	239
C. A. Robbe.....	290	239
H. A. Mansfield.....	290	240
E. B. Thomasson.....	291	241

INDEX.

vii

	Original.	Print.
Exhibit A—Letter, Manion & Co. to Chattanooga Foundry and Pipe Works, June 20, 1895 . . . . .	293	242
Certified copies of ordinances of city of St. Louis, Nos. 18188, 18563, 18566, and 18565. . . . .	293	243
Copy of St. Louis contract. . . . .	297	246
Letter, W. C. Marshall to F. B. Nichols, January 18, 1897. . . . .	307	254
H. R. Gamble to Chattanooga Pipe and Foundry Co., November 7, 1896. . . . .	310	257
J. E. McClure to Abbot-Gamble Contracting Co., November 21, 1896 . . . . .	310	257
E. M. Dodson, April 29, 1896. . . . .	311	258
J. E. McClure to Abbot-Gamble Contracting Co. . . . .	312	258
Replication . . . . .	313	260
Affidavit of M. L. Holman. . . . .	314	260
Petition for contempt. . . . .	315	261
Rule to show cause on petition for contempt. . . . .	319	265
Order continuing hearing of rule to show cause, &c. . . . .	320	265
Order for execution against Howard-Harrison Iron Co. upon confession of judgment. . . . .	320	265
Order discharging rule as to Addyston Pipe and Steel Co. <i>et al.</i> . . . .	321	266
Citation for contempt. . . . .	321	266
Answer of Howard-Harrison Iron Co. to petition for contempt. . . . .	322	267
Dennis Long & Co. to petition for contempt . . . . .	324	268
South Pittsburg Pipe Works to petition for contempt. . . . .	325	269
Anniston Pipe and Foundry Co. to petition for contempt. . . . .	326	270
Chattanooga Foundry and Pipe Works to petition for contempt. . . . .	327	271
Addyston Pipe and Steel Co. to petition for contempt . . . . .	329	273
Affidavit of Sparlock for defendant . . . . .	330	274
Opinion of Clark, J. . . . .	332	275
Order continuing application for injunction, &c. . . . .	348	288
Final decree. . . . .	348	288
Petition for appeal and allowance thereof . . . . .	349	289
Assignment of errors. . . . .	350	290
Order for appeal. . . . .	351	291
Clerk's certificate. . . . .	351	291
Appearance for appellant. . . . .	353	291
Notice of motion to advance. . . . .	353	292
Order beginning hearing . . . . .	354	292
Order concluding hearing . . . . .	355	293
Final decree. . . . .	355	293
Opinion. . . . .	357	293
Petition for appeal and allowance thereof. . . . .	394	327
Assignment of errors. . . . .	395	328
Appeal bond. . . . .	397	329
Citation. . . . .	399	330
Acceptance of service of citation. . . . .	400	330
Clerk's certificate. . . . .	401	331