

3  
1

Supreme Court, U.S.  
**FILED**  
**DEC 31 1992**  
OFFICE OF THE CLERK

No. 92-466

In The  
**Supreme Court of the United States**  
October Term, 1992

—◆—  
**LIGGETT GROUP INC.,**  
now named Brooke Group Ltd.,  
*Petitioner,*  
  
vs.

**BROWN & WILLIAMSON**  
**TOBACCO CORPORATION,**  
*Respondent.*

—◆—  
**On Writ Of Certiorari To The**  
**United States Court Of Appeals**  
**For The Fourth Circuit**

—◆—  
**JOINT APPENDIX**  
**VOLUME I, PAGES 1-273**  
—◆—

PHILLIP AREEDA  
1545 Massachusetts Avenue  
Cambridge, Massachusetts  
02138  
(617) 495-3160  
*Counsel of Record*  
for Petitioner

GRIFFIN B. BELL  
KING & SPALDING  
191 Peachtree Street  
Atlanta, Georgia 30303  
(404) 572-4600  
*Counsel of Record*  
for Respondent

*(For Complete Appearances See Reverse Side Of Cover)*

---

**Petition For Certiorari Filed September 16, 1992**  
**Certiorari Granted November 16, 1992**

---

COCKLE LAW BRIEF PRINTING CO., (800) 225-6964  
OR CALL COLLECT (402) 342-2831

509  
—  
209

Library of Congress  
Law Library

*Of Counsel for Petitioner*

CHARLES FRIED  
1545 Massachusetts Avenue  
Cambridge, Massachusetts  
02138  
(617) 495-4636

WILLIAM H. HOGE LAND, JR.  
ANTHONY M. D'IORIO  
MUDGE ROSE GUTHRIE  
ALEXANDER & FERDON  
180 MAIDEN LANE  
NEW YORK, NY 10038  
(212) 510-7000

GARRET G. RASMUSSEN  
C. ALLEN FOSTER  
KENNETH L. GLAZER  
PATTON, BOGGS & BLOW  
2550 M Street, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20037  
(202) 457-6000

JEAN E. SHARPE  
BROOKE GROUP LTD.  
65 East 55th Street  
New York, NY 10022  
(212) 486-6100

JOSIAH S. MURRAY, III  
JAMES W. DOBBINS  
LIGGETT GROUP INC.  
300 North Duke Street  
Durham, North Carolina 27702  
(919) 683-8802

*Of Counsel for Respondent*

NORWOOD ROBINSON  
MICHAEL ROBINSON  
ROBINSON MAREADY LAWING  
& COMERFORD  
380 Knollwood Street  
Suite 300  
Winston-Salem, NC 27103  
(919) 631-8500



## TABLE OF CONTENTS - Continued

	Page
August 8, 1983	Charts from B&W GPC Presentation ..... 41
August 31, 1983	Gary Tobacco Company Strategic Planning ..... 44
January 25, 1984	Memorandum from E. Par-rack, Jr., to D. Johnston, C. Dunn, H. Roder, C. Heger, E. Kohnhorst, R. Sachs ..... 46
February 2, 1984	The Maxwell Report - Revised 1983 Year-End Sales Estimates for the Cigarette Industry..... 51
February 7, 1984	Memorandum from A. Diebold to C. Heger re: Generic Business ..... 53
February 9, 1984	B&W Generics Presentation ..... 55
1st Quarter 1984	Handwritten Notes - T. Olges ..... 60
1st Quarter 1984	Generic Cigarette Category ..... 62
February 1984	Situation Analysis ..... 65
February 1984	L&M Agenda..... 80
March 9, 1984	B&W Generic Proposal ..... 81
March 9, 1984	B&W 1984 Strategic Plan and 10 Year Forecast..... 95
March 22, 1984	Memorandum from R. Blott to I. Hughes, T. Sandefur, J. Alar, cc: J. McDonough, C. Heger, D. Falk ..... 98

## TABLE OF CONTENTS - Continued

	Page
March 22, 1984	B&W Report on Generics Memorandum re: Eric Bruell Telex..... 101
April 26, 1984	Memorandum from D. Falk to E. Parrack re: "Black and White" and Private Label Offering..... 105
April 30, 1984	Note from I. Hughes with attached Telex re: RJR Doral Introduction..... 110
May 1, 1984	B&W Report on Generic "Black and White" and Pri- vate Label Offerings Versus Branded Generic Offering..... 112
May 2, 1984	B&W Memorandum from J. Hite to D. Falk re: Competi- tive Activity - Doral ..... 116
May 4, 1984	B&W Strategies for Economy Cigarettes ..... 120
May 15, 1984	B&W Generics Final Pro- posal..... 127
May 15, 1984	B&W Memorandum from T. Olges to L. Butler, D. Chris- tensen, C. Middleton, A. Rozek, D. Bores, J. Tharaldson, G. Greenier re: Domestic Competitive Anal- ysis ..... 157
May 17, 1984	B&W Memorandum from D. Christensen to R. Blott, cc: L. Butler, D. Falk re: Project Volume - Status..... 166

## TABLE OF CONTENTS - Continued

		Page
May 22, 1984	B&W Notes on Project Volume Task Force Meeting, 5/22/84.....	173
May 22, 1984	B&W Trading Profit Effect of Launching Generics, Prepared by C. Heger .....	176
June 4, 1984	B&W (Heartland) Generic Cigarettes .....	178
June 13, 1984	L&M Memorandum to: D. Hunt from C. Avery re: Q Seal Program.....	182
June 22, 1984	Handwritten Note from C. Jova and Letter from City Sales, Inc. to Heartland Tobacco Company.....	185
July 2, 1984	L&M Press Release re: Lawsuit .....	188
July 10, 1984	B&W Letter from G. Gratta to D. Christensen.....	189
July 13, 1984	Status Report: B&W's Generic Entries.....	192
July 18, 1984	L&M Press Release.....	196
July 19, 1984	B&W Field Sales Notice Volume Rebate Offers.....	197
July 26, 1984	B&W Memorandum from A. Diebold to C. Heger re: Liggett Strategy in Regard to Generics.....	198
August 17, 1984	Generic Cigarette Pricing Summary.....	201

## TABLE OF CONTENTS – Continued

		Page
1984	L&M National Management Conference – Generic/Private Label Presentation.....	207
1985	1985 Operational Plans – Domestic Marketing .....	234
February 20, 1985	Stride Promotion .....	237
February 26, 1985	B&W Memorandum from D. Christensen to R. Blott, cc: L. Butler, H. Kerr, D. Dant re Generic versus Full Revenue Pricing Comparisons.....	238
March 5, 1985	Batus Letter from H. Frigon to Dr. I. Hughes (B&W) .....	240
March 6, 1985	B&W Memorandum from R. Blott to T. Sandefur, cc: J. Alar, W. DeWitt, I. Hughes, C. Heger, B. Lowdenback re: Response to CPC Customers ...	242
March 21, 1985	B&W Memorandum from T. Sandefur to J. Alar re: Competitive Strategy Review.....	243
April 2, 1985	L&M Memorandum from B. Ruggiero to L. Browning, B. Daugherty, B. Dear re: Direct Account Business Presentations .....	254
April 9, 1985	B&W Memorandum from T. Olges to J. Alar, T. Sandefur, R. Blott, W. Dewitt, C. Heger, B. Lowdenback, cc: B. Bacon, J. Wells re: Chairman’s Advisory Committee IX .....	256

## TABLE OF CONTENTS - Continued

		Page
April 15, 1985	B&W's <i>Executive Summary - Liggett Acquisition</i> .....	260
April 19, 1985	B&W Memorandum from T. Sandefur to C. McCarty, H. Frigon re: Richland 250's National Launch and Proposed Generic Pricing Strategy .....	262
June 21, 1985	L&M Memorandum from T. Winterhalder to All Sacramento Sales Reps.....	264
July 18, 1985	Letter from H. Frigon (Batus) to G. Dennis re: GPC contract .....	267
July 23, 1985	(B&W) Richland Trade Press Briefing .....	272
VOLUME II		
July 29, 1985	Handwritten Notes E. Par-rack.....	274
August 15, 1985	B&W Memorandum from B. Bacon to R. Blott, cc: L. Butler, T. Whitehair, T. Olges, C. Heger, T. Mooring, T. Wilson ...	277
October 1985	B&W 1986-1990 Corporate Plan.....	281
December 9, 1985	(L&M) Doral Competitive Entries Short and Long Term Strategy Recommendation .....	284



## TABLE OF CONTENTS - Continued

	Page
January 8, 1986	B&W Addendum Position Paper Current Status of B&W's Generics by B. Bacon ... 287
February 3, 1986	The Maxwell Report - Revised 1985 Year-end Sales Estimates for the Cigarette Industry..... 290
June 16, 1986	(B&W) Mailgram - Price Change Announcement..... 295
June 20, 1986	(L&M) Mailgram - Price Change Announcement..... 297
December 4, 1987	(L&M) Mailgram - Price Change Announcement..... 299
December 8, 1987	(L&M) Mailgram - Price Change Announcement..... 301
1988	Sami/Burke - Private Label & Generic Analysis..... 303
June 16, 1988	(B&W) Mailgram - Price Change Announcement..... 304
June 17, 1988	(L&M) Mailgram - Price Change Announcement..... 306
July 28, 1988	Article - Durham Sun, 1st L&M Stockholder Session Brief; firm said stronger..... 308
December 12, 1988	Pyramid Report - New Prod- uct Introduction..... 312
January 27, 1989	The Maxwell Consumer Report 1988 Year End Sales Estimates..... 317

## TABLE OF CONTENTS - Continued

	Page
May 1989	U.S. Distribution Journal Article Pyramid Program Eyed..... 322
July 12, 1989	Summary Exhibit: Annual market share of generics 1980 - 1988..... 324
July 12, 1989	Summary Exhibit L&M Lig- gett & Myers generic ciga- rette (King Size) List Price Differential Between Branded Cigarettes and Generic Cigarettes May 1980 to June 1989..... 325
July 24, 1989	List Price for Cigarettes Branded & Generic 1981-89.... 326
August 9, 1989	Summary of Documents Showing Liggett & Myers' Rebate Programs, for Broker Customers and B&W's Rebate Programs as Announced to Sales Person- nel June 4 - July 20, 1984 ..... 327
August 9, 1989	Summary of Documents Showing Liggett & Myers' Rebate Programs, for Broker Customers and B&W's Rebate Programs as Announced to Sales Person- nel June 4 - July 20, 1984 ..... 328
August 24, 1989	Handwritten Notes - A. Diebold on Generics..... 329

## TABLE OF CONTENTS - Continued

	Page
September 27, 1989	B&W Generic King Size List Price Differential Between Branded Cigarettes and Generic Cigarettes..... 330
October 3, 1989	Department of Justice Merger Guidelines Concen- tration Standards..... 331
October 3, 1989	U.S. Cigarette Sales Market Share and Concentration..... 332
October 4, 1989	Chart: Cigarette Industry Profitability ..... 333
October 5, 1989	Summary Chart: B&W Generic Cigarettes Excess of Average Variable Costs Over Net Revenues for the Period July 1984 - December 1985 .... 334
October 5, 1989	Summary Chart: B&W Generic Cigarettes Excess of Variable Costs Per Carton Over Net Revenue Per Car- ton for the Period July 1984 - December 1985 ..... 336
October 5, 1989	Summary Chart: B&W Generic Cigarettes Excess of Variable Costs Over Net Revenues for the Period July 1984 - December 1985 ..... 338
October 5, 1989	Summary Chart: B&W Generic Cigarettes Excess of Variable Costs Per Carton Over Net Revenue Per Car- ton for the Period July 1984 - December 1985 ..... 339

## TABLE OF CONTENTS - Continued

	Page
October 5, 1989	Chart: B&W Generic Cigarettes Excess of Variable Costs Over Net Revenues for the Period July 1984 - December 1985 ..... 340
October 5, 1989	Chart: B&W Generic Cigarettes Excess of Average Variable Costs Per Carton Over Net Revenue Per Carton for the Period July 1984 - December 1985 ..... 341
October 5, 1989	Chart: B&W Generic Cigarettes Excess of Variable Costs Over Net Revenues for the Period July 1984 - December 1985 ..... 342
October 5, 1989	Chart: B&W Generic Cigarettes Excess of Average Variable Costs Per Carton Over Net Revenue Per Carton for the Period July 1984 - December 1985 ..... 343
October 5, 1989	Summary Chart: Generic Cigarettes Calculation of B&W's Full Variable Margin for the Period July 1984 - December 1985 ..... 344
October 5, 1989	Chart: Generic Cigarettes Calculation of B&W's Full Variable Margin Per Carton for the Period July 1984 - December 1985 ..... 346

## TABLE OF CONTENTS – Continued

	Page
February 2, 1990 MSA Cigarette Industry Report – December 1989.....	348
February 2, 1990 1989 Liggett Group Inc. Annual Report .....	376
Excerpt of Trial Proceedings of: Court.....	381
(Jury Instructions; oral charge).....	767
Excerpt of Trial Testimony of: K. v. R. Dey.....	386
Excerpt of Trial Testimony of: H. Grant.....	402
Excerpt of Trial Testimony of: C. Eads.....	409
Excerpt of Trial Testimony of: T. Sandefur.....	432
Excerpt of Trial Testimony of: T. Olges.....	461
Excerpt of Trial Testimony of: D. Jackson.....	468
Excerpt of Trial Testimony of: L. Butler.....	478, 671
Excerpt of Trial Testimony of: W. Burnett.....	480
 VOLUME III	
Excerpt of Trial Testimony of: W. Burnett – con’t. .	548
Excerpt of Trial Testimony of: B. Bacon.....	648, 694
Excerpt of Trial Testimony of: K. Elzinga.....	650, 712
Excerpt of Trial Testimony of: D. Mills.....	651
Excerpt of Trial Testimony of: T. Keller.....	663
Excerpt of Trial Testimony of: H. Higgins.....	689
Excerpt of Trial Testimony of: J. Winebrenner.....	755
Excerpt of Trial Testimony of: R. Ray.....	761
Jury Instructions: written charge.....	813

KEY

In this Joint Appendix, brackets indicate text added by counsel to inform the Court of appropriate notations or other information not appearing on the face of the document itself. Where the date of a document has been derived by reference to its accompanying testimony, the citation (Tr. \_\_\_:\_\_\_) to such testimony has been included with the document's date.