

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
EASTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, et al.,  
Plaintiffs,

v.

AMERICAN EXPRESS CO., et al.,  
Defendants.

Civil Action No.:  
1:10-CV-04496-NGG-RER

**NOTICE OF MOTION IN LIMINE TO EXCLUDE  
DR. GEORGE HAY'S AND DR. B. DOUGLAS BERNHEIM'S  
UNRELIABLE MARKET DEFINITION ANALYSIS**

PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that, upon the Memorandum of Law in Support of Plaintiffs' Motion in Limine to Exclude Dr. George Hay's and Dr. B. Douglas Bernheim's Unreliable Market Definition Analysis, dated March 26, 2014, the accompanying Declaration of Joseph P. Vardner, dated March 26, 2014, with accompanying exhibits, and all the pleadings and papers filed with respect thereto, Plaintiffs the United States of America, the State of Arizona, the State of Connecticut, the State of Idaho, the State of Illinois, the State of Iowa, the State of Maryland, the State of Michigan, the State of Missouri, the State of Montana, the State of Nebraska, the State of New Hampshire, the State of Ohio, the State of Rhode Island, the State of Tennessee, the State of Texas, the State of Utah, and the State of Vermont hereby move this Court, before the Honorable Nicholas G. Garaufis, at the United States Courthouse for the Eastern District of New York, 225 Cadman Plaza East, Brooklyn, New York, 11201, for an order pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 702 and Rule of Evidence 402 excluding Dr. George Hay's and Dr. B. Douglas Bernheim's market definition analysis from trial.

PLEASE TAKE FURTHER NOTICE that a proposed form of Order is submitted  
herewith.

Dated: March 26, 2014

Respectfully submitted,

**U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE**

/s/Craig W. Conrath  
Craig W. Conrath  
(craig.conrath@usdoj.gov)  
U.S. Department of Justice, Antitrust Division  
450 Fifth Street, NW, Suite 4000  
Washington, DC 20530  
Tel: (202) 532-4560  
Fax: (202) 307-9952

*Counsel for Plaintiff United States of America*

**OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL  
State of Ohio**

/s/Mitchell L. Gentile  
Mitchell L. Gentile  
(mitchell.gentile@ohioattorneygeneral.gov)  
Office of the Ohio Attorney General  
150 East Gay Street, 23<sup>rd</sup> Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215  
Tel: (614) 466-4328  
Fax: (614) 995-0266

*Counsel for State of Ohio and on behalf of all  
Plaintiff States*

TO:

Evan R. Chesler, Esq.  
Peter T. Barbur, Esq.  
CRAVATH, SWAINE & MOORE LLP  
Worldwide Plaza  
825 Eighth Avenue  
New York, NY 10019

Donald L. Flexner, Esq.  
Philip C. Korologos, Esq.  
BOIES, SCHILLER & FLEXNER LLP  
575 Lexington Avenue  
New York, NY 10022

*Counsel for Defendants American Express Co. and  
American Express Travel Related Services Company, Inc.*

VIA ECF AND ELECTRONIC MAIL

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
EASTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, et al.,  
Plaintiffs,

v.

AMERICAN EXPRESS CO., et al.,  
Defendants.

Civil Action No.:  
1:10-CV-04496-NGG-RER

**[PROPOSED] ORDER EXCLUDING CERTAIN  
EXPERT OPINIONS ON THE RELEVANT MARKET**

WHEREAS, the Court has considered the Memorandum of Law in Support of Plaintiffs' Motion in Limine to Exclude Dr. George Hay's and Dr. B. Douglas Bernheim's Unreliable Market Definition Analysis, dated March 26, 2014, the accompanying Declaration of Joseph P. Vardner, dated March 26, 2014, with accompanying exhibits, and all the pleadings and papers filed with respect thereto; and good cause has otherwise been shown;

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Plaintiffs' Motion in Limine to Exclude Dr. George Hay's and Dr. B. Douglas Bernheim's Unreliable Market Definition Analysis is GRANTED in its entirety; and

IT IS HEREBY FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants' experts Dr. George Hay or Dr. B. Douglas Bernheim shall be precluded from offering at trial the opinion that the relevant market includes debit.

SO ORDERED:

\_\_\_\_\_  
HON. NICHOLAS G. GARAUFI  
UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

Dated: Brooklyn, N.Y.

\_\_\_\_\_, 2014