

Vol. A.

TRANSCRIPT OF RECORD.

SUPREME COURT OF THE UNITED STATES.

OCTOBER TERM, 1909.

No. 725.

1910
157

STANDARD GIL COMPANY ET AL., APPELLANTS,

vs.

THE UNITED STATES.

**APPEAL FROM THE CIRCUIT COURT OF THE UNITED STATES FOR
THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF MISSOURI.**

FILED JANUARY 3, 1910.

(21,951)

(21,951)

SUPREME COURT OF THE UNITED STATES.

OCTOBER TERM, 1909.

No. 725.

STANDARD OIL COMPANY ET AL., APPELLANTS,

vs. *

THE UNITED STATES.

APPEAL FROM THE CIRCUIT COURT OF THE UNITED STATES FOR
THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF MISSOURI.

INDEX.

| | Original. | Print. |
|---|-----------|--------|
| Caption | 1 | 1 |
| Bill of complaint | 1 | 1 |
| Table of contents of bill | 1 | 1 |
| Section I—General allegation of conspiracy; definition of periods | 9 | 6 |
| Section II—Organization of Standard Oil Company of Ohio; acquisition of Cleveland refineries | 12 | 8 |
| Section III—General conduct of conspiracy. First period, 1870-1882 | 14 | 9 |
| Acquisition of control; method of combination | 14 | 9 |
| Contract between refiners and producers | 17 | 10 |
| Conspiracy to obtain rebates from railroads | 20 | 11 |
| South Improvement Company contract | 22 | 12 |
| Contracts with Erie railroad | 26 | 14 |
| Contract with New York Central & Hudson River railroad | 27 | 15 |
| Control of terminal facilities | 27 | 15 |
| Railroad freight pool agreement of 1874 | 28 | 15 |
| Rebate of 22 cents per barrel on Atlantic seaboard shipments | 29 | 16 |
| Additional 10 per cent. rebate | 30 | 16 |

| | Original. | Print |
|---|-----------|-------|
| Preferential rates to the Pacific coast..... | 30 | 16 |
| Contest with Empire Transportation Company..... | 30 | 16 |
| Contract for division of traffic with trunk lines..... | 32 | 17 |
| Rebates to American Transfer Company..... | 33 | 18 |
| Suits against the Pennsylvania railroad and others for conspiracy to monopolize trade..... | 36 | 19 |
| Agreement to dismiss pending cases..... | 37 | 19 |
| Acquisition of control of pipe lines..... | 38 | 20 |
| Section IV—Period of Standard Oil Trust, 1882-1899..... | 39 | 20 |
| Organization of trust..... | 39 | 21 |
| Copy of trust agreement of 1882..... | 40 | 21 |
| Copy of trust certificate..... | 57 | 32 |
| Certificate holders of Standard Oil Trust..... | 58 | 33 |
| List of corporations controlled by Standard Oil Trust in 1888..... | 60 | 35 |
| Trust certificates outstanding, 1892..... | 62 | 36 |
| Copy of resolution of March 21, 1892, dissolving trust. | 64 | 38 |
| Copy of assignment of legal title to stocks held by trust. | 67 | 40 |
| Section V—Organization of Standard Oil Company of New Jersey; general allegation of conspiracy..... | 70 | 41 |
| Organization; transfer of stocks..... | 73 | 43 |
| List of Standard Oil Companies..... | 75 | 44 |
| Description of business; interstate character..... | 78 | 46 |
| Allegation of restraint and monopolization..... | 85 | 49 |
| Section VI—Agreement with tidewater companies..... | 86 | 49 |
| Section VII—Contract with Pennsylvania Railroad Com- pany..... | 89 | 51 |
| Section VIII—Monopolization by control of pipe lines.... | 92 | 53 |
| Policy and its effect..... | 93 | 53 |
| Contract with National Petroleum Association..... | 94 | 53 |
| Section IX—Unfair practices against competing pipe lines.. | 97 | 55 |
| Premiums..... | 97 | 55 |
| Contest with United States pipe line..... | 99 | 56 |
| Section X—Contracts in restraint of trade..... | 101 | 57 |
| Contract with crude producers to limit production..... | 102 | 57 |
| Contracts with Colorado and California companies for exclusive purchase of products... .. | 103 | 58 |
| Contracts with crude producers in California..... | 105 | 58 |
| Section XI—General allegation of railroad discrimination.. | 108 | 60 |
| Section XII—Railroad discrimination in Southern States.. | 110 | 61 |
| Discriminations via Evansville..... | 112 | 62 |
| Discriminations via Grand Junction..... | 113 | 62 |
| Comparisons of rates to Southern points..... | 118 | 65 |
| Section XIII—Discrimination in Southwestern territory... | 124 | 71 |
| Secret rates—Whiting to East St. Louis..... | 124 | 71 |
| Rates to Alexandria and other points from St. Louis... | 123 | 72 |
| Comparison of rates to East St. Louis from Pittsburg, Cleveland, Toledo, Whiting, and Rochester..... | 129 | 73 |
| Section XIV—Discrimination in rates from Kansas points. | 130 | 73 |
| Rates to Kansas City and St. Louis..... | 130 | 73 |
| Weight of crude and fuel oil..... | 131 | 74 |
| Rates to Springfield, Mo..... | 132 | 74 |

| | Original. | Print |
|--|-----------|-------|
| Section XV—Failure to prorate on shipments to Pacific coast | 133 | 75 |
| Section XVI—Failure to prorate on shipments to northwest. | 135 | 76 |
| Section XVII—Discrimination in New York and New England..... | 137 | 77 |
| Rates to Rochester and Buffalo..... | 138 | 77 |
| Rates to Vermont..... | 141 | 79 |
| Secret less-than-carload rates of Central Vermont railway from Burlington points..... | 143 | 81 |
| Special tank-car rates, Central Vermont railway, from Burlington..... | 144 | 82 |
| Section XVIII—Discriminations between Parkersburg and Marietta..... | 147 | 84 |
| Section XIX—Discriminations in California | 149 | 86 |
| Table showing rates of Southern Pacific railroad and Atchison, Topeka & Santa Fe railroad at variance with published tariff, 1904..... | 151 | 87 |
| Section XX—Discrimination in Central States..... | 153 | 88 |
| Rates over Lake Shore & Michigan Southern railroad from Toledo and Whiting to intermediate points.... | 154 | 89 |
| Rates from Whiting and Rochester and competing points to Ohio River crossings | 156 | 91 |
| Rates from Whiting, Toledo, Cleveland, and Pittsburg to Michigan points..... | 157 | 92 |
| Rates from Pittsburg, Cleveland, Toledo, and Whiting to points in Ohio, Michigan, Indiana, Illinois, and Kentucky | 158 | 93 |
| Section XXI—General system of discrimination; control of railroads..... | 162 | 97 |
| General inequality of rates..... | 162 | 97 |
| Acquisition of stock in railroads and representation on boards of various railroads..... | 164 | 97 |
| Section XXII—Monopoly of sale of lubricating oils to railroads..... | 167 | 100 |
| Section XXIII—Unfair methods of competing; local price-cutting..... | 173 | 103 |
| Section XXIV—Reports of competitors' shipments | 176 | 104 |
| Section XXV—Operation of "bogus" independent companies..... | 178 | 105 |
| Section XXVI—Payment of rebates on oil prices..... | 181 | 107 |
| Section XXVII—Profits of Standard Oil Trust and Company | 182 | 107 |
| Section XXVIII—Division of territory..... | 185 | 109 |
| Section XXIX—Jurisdiction..... | 187 | 110 |
| Section XXX—Prayer for relief..... | 188 | 111 |
| Exhibit 1—Contract dated December 19, 1872, between the Petroleum Producers' Association and the Petroleum Refiners' Association..... | 195 | 114 |
| 2—Contract dated January 18, 1872, between the South Improvement Company and the Pennsylvania Railroad relative to rebates..... | 198 | 116 |

| | Original. | Print. |
|--|-----------|---------|
| Exhibit 3—Contract dated April 17, 1874, between Erie Railway Company and Atlantic & Great Western Railroad Company and Standard Oil Company of Ohio relative to Weehawken oil yards, New York. | 208 | 124 |
| 4—Contract dated March 1, 1875, between the Standard Oil Company of Ohio and the Erie Railroad relative to Weehawken oil yards. | 213 | 127 |
| 5—Contract dated January 1, 1876, between the New York Central & Hudson River Railroad, Lake Shore & Michigan Southern Railroad, and the Standard Oil Company relative to rebate of 10 per cent. of rate | 217 | 129 |
| 6—Pool agreement relative to oil shipments, dated October 1, 1874 | 220 | 131 |
| 7—Standard Oil Company letter to Thomas A. Scott with reply, dated October 17, 1877; Standard to act as evener of petroleum shipments over trunk lines and receiving 10 per cent. rebate..... | 227 | 136 |
| 8—Letter of Daniel O'Day to Pennsylvania Railroad Company, dated February 15, 1878, asking for rebate to American Transfer Company of 20 cents per barrel on petroleum shipments and reply agreeing thereto..... | 231 | 138 |
| 9—Contract dated January 1, 1877, between American Transfer Company and the Erie Railway Company for rebate of 20 cents per barrel on crude oil..... | 234 | 140 |
| 10—Stipulation dated January 29, 1880, to abrogate rebate contracts and dismiss pending suits of State of Pennsylvania vs. John D. Rockefeller and others, charged with conspiracy..... | 236 | 141 |
| 11—By-laws of Standard Oil Trust..... | 242 | 146 |
| 12—By-laws of Standard Oil Company of New Jersey.. | 247 | 149 |
| 13—Contracts dated October 9, 1883, between Standard Oil Company and Tidewater Pipe Company (Limited) and the Tidewater refineries relative to division of business..... | 251 | 152 |
| 14—Traffic agreement dated August 22, 1884, between the Pennsylvania Railroad Company and the National Transit Company..... | 262 | 160 |
| 15—Contract of 1903 between Standard Oil Company and independent refiners relative to purchase and sale of export oil..... | 269 | 165 |
| 16—Contract dated November 1, 1897, between Standard Oil Company and producers to limit production of crude oil | 272 | 167 |
| 17—Contract dated March 31, 1898, between Standard Oil Company of Iowa and Puente Oil Company relative to sale and purchase of refined oil..... | 274 | 168 |
| 18—Map showing average price charged for illuminating oil of medium grade in bulk to retailers in the United States during 1904..... | 277 | op. 170 |

INDEX.

v

| | Original. | Print. |
|---|-----------|--------|
| Subpoena..... | 279 | 171 |
| Marshal's return..... | 280 | 172 |
| Petition for order for service on non-resident defendants..... | 281 | 173 |
| Order for additional subpoenas..... | 288 | 177 |
| Subpoena and return of service on Corsicana Refining Co..... | 292 | 180 |
| Atlantic Refining Co..... | 294 | 182 |
| Argand Refining Co..... | 296 | 184 |
| Henry H. Rogers <i>et al.</i> | 298 | 185 |
| Florena Oil and Refining Co. <i>et al.</i> | 305 | 190 |
| Republic Oil Co. <i>et al.</i> | 307 | 192 |
| Eureka Pipe Line Co. <i>et al.</i> | 309 | 194 |
| Standard Oil Co. of Kansas..... | 311 | 196 |
| Standard Oil Co. of Minnesota.. | 313 | 198 |
| Oswego Mfg. Co..... | 315 | 200 |
| Security Oil Co..... | 317 | 201 |
| Standard Oil Co. of Kentucky <i>et al.</i> | 319 | 203 |
| Manhattan Oil Co. <i>et al.</i> | 321 | 205 |
| Vacuum Oil Co..... | 325 | 208 |
| Eclipse Lubricating Oil Co..... | 327 | 210 |
| Standard Oil Co. of California... | 329 | 212 |
| Indiana Pipe Line Co..... | 331 | 214 |
| Standard Oil Co. of Nebraska... | 333 | 216 |
| Borne-Scrymser Co. <i>et al.</i> | 335 | 218 |
| Baltimore United Oil Co..... | 337 | 220 |
| Eastern Ohio Oil & Gas Co..... | 339 | 221 |
| Corsicana Refining Co. <i>et al.</i> | 341 | 223 |
| Standard Oil Co. of Iowa <i>et al.</i> ... | 344 | 225 |
| Motion of Standard Oil Co. of New Jersey <i>et al.</i> to vacate order for service on non-resident defendants..... | 346 | 226 |
| Affidavit of Charles T. White..... | 348 | 227 |
| Motion of Tide Water Oil Co. <i>et al.</i> to vacate order for service on non-resident defendants..... | 350 | 228 |
| Affidavit of Samuel Q. Brown..... | 351 | 229 |
| Motion of Manhattan Oil Co. to quash order for service on non- resident defendants..... | 353 | 230 |
| Plea of Corsicana Refining Co. to bill..... | 355 | 231 |
| Appearance of Florence Oil & Refining Co..... | 358 | 233 |
| Motion of Security Oil Co. to vacate order for service on non-resi- dent defendants..... | 359 | 233 |
| Affidavit of O. C. Edwards..... | 360 | 234 |
| Appearance of Waters-Pierce Oil Co..... | 362 | 235 |
| Certificate of Attorney-General to expedite the cause..... | 363 | 236 |
| Order setting motions to set aside order for service for hearing..... | 365 | 237 |
| Præcipe for process as to certain defendants..... | 366 | 238 |
| Motions and pleas argued and submitted..... | 368 | 238 |
| Stipulation as to time for pleading of defendant, Florence O. & R. Co. | 368 | 238 |
| Order overruling motions to vacate, &c. | 369 | 239 |
| Plea of Anglo-American Oil Co., Ltd..... | 371 | 240 |
| Atlantic Refining Co..... | 373 | 242 |
| Borne-Scrymser Co..... | 375 | 244 |
| The Buckeye Pipe Line Co..... | 377 | 247 |
| Buffalo Natural Gas Fuel Co..... | 379 | 249 |

| | Original. | Print |
|---|-----------|-------|
| Plea of Chesebrough Mfg. Co..... | 381 | 251 |
| Colonial Oil Co..... | 383 | 254 |
| Commercial Natural Gas Co..... | 385 | 256 |
| Connecting Gas Co..... | 387 | 258 |
| Continental Oil Co..... | 389 | 260 |
| Crescent Pipe Line Co..... | 391 | 263 |
| Cumberland Pipe Line Co..... | 393 | 265 |
| The East Ohio Gas Co..... | 395 | 267 |
| The Eureka Pipe Line Co..... | 397 | 269 |
| Franklin Pipe Co., Ltd..... | 399 | 272 |
| Galena Signal Oil Co..... | 401 | 274 |
| Indiana Pipe Line Co..... | 403 | 276 |
| Lawrence Natural Gas Co..... | 405 | 279 |
| The Mahoning Gas Fuel Co..... | 407 | 281 |
| Mountain State Gas Co..... | 409 | 283 |
| National Pure Gas Co..... | 411 | 286 |
| National Transit Co..... | 413 | 284 |
| New York Transit Co..... | 415 | 290 |
| Northern Pipe Line Co..... | 417 | 293 |
| The Northwestern Ohio Natural Gas Co. <i>et al.</i> | 419 | 295 |
| The Ohio Oil Company..... | 421 | 297 |
| Oil City Fuel Supply Co..... | 423 | 299 |
| Pennsylvania Oil Co..... | 425 | 302 |
| Pennsylvania Gas Co..... | 427 | 304 |
| People's Natural Gas Co..... | 429 | 306 |
| Pittsburgh Natural Gas Co..... | 431 | 309 |
| Prairie Oil and Gas Co..... | 433 | 311 |
| Republic Oil Co..... | 435 | 313 |
| Salamanca Gas Co..... | 437 | 315 |
| Solar Refining Co..... | 439 | 318 |
| Southern Pipe Line Co..... | 441 | 320 |
| South Penn Oil Co..... | 443 | 322 |
| Southwest Pennsylvania Pipe Lines..... | 445 | 325 |
| Standard Oil Co. of California..... | 447 | 327 |
| Indiana..... | 449 | 329 |
| Iowa..... | 451 | 332 |
| Kansas..... | 453 | 334 |
| Kentucky..... | 455 | 336 |
| Nebraska..... | 457 | 339 |
| New York..... | 459 | 341 |
| Ohio..... | 461 | 343 |
| Swan & Finch Company..... | 463 | 346 |
| Taylorstown Natural Gas Co..... | 465 | 348 |
| Union Tank Line Co..... | 467 | 350 |
| United Natural Gas Co..... | 469 | 353 |
| Vacuum Oil Co..... | 471 | 355 |
| Washington Oil Co..... | 473 | 357 |
| The United Oil Company..... | 475 | 359 |
| Plea of Standard Oil Company of New Jersey, John D. Rockefeller, Wm. Rockefeller, Henry H. Rogers, Henry M. Flagler, John D. Archbold, Oliver H. Payne, and Charles M. Pratt..... | 477 | 362 |
| Plea of Standard Oil Company of New Jersey <i>et al.</i> , verified by Henry M. Flagler..... | 482 | 365 |

| | Original. | Print |
|---|-----------|-------|
| Plea of Standard Oil Company of New Jersey <i>et al.</i> , verified by Oliver H. Payne..... | 487 | 369 |
| Plea of Security Oil Company..... | 492 | 372 |
| Order overruling pleas to jurisdiction, &c..... | 494 | 374 |
| Appearance of Tide Water Pipe Co..... | 496 | 375 |
| Appearance of Tide Water Oil Co..... | 497 | 375 |
| Appearance of Platt & Washburn Co..... | 497 | 375 |
| Plea of Manhattan Oil Co..... | 498 | 376 |
| Order overruling plea of Manhattan Oil Co..... | 500 | 377 |
| Answer of United Oil Company..... | 502 | 378 |
| Tide Water Oil Company..... | 507 | 381 |
| Tide Water Pipe Co., Ltd..... | 512 | 386 |
| Platt & Washburn Refining Co..... | 517 | 390 |
| Florence Oil and Refining Co..... | 521 | 394 |
| Manhattan Oil Company..... | 525 | 397 |
| Joint answer of Connecting Gas Co. <i>et al.</i> | 531 | 401 |
| Buffalo Natural Gas Fuel Co. <i>et al.</i> | 535 | 403 |
| Standard Oil Co. of New Jersey <i>et al.</i> | 538 | 404 |
| Joint exceptions to bill of complaint by Standard Oil Co. of New Jersey <i>et al.</i> | 604 | 437 |
| Answer of Security Oil Company..... | 618 | 443 |
| Waters-Pierce Oil Co..... | 629 | 454 |
| Corsicana Refining Co..... | 636 | 458 |
| Exceptions by Corsicana Refining Co. to bill of complaint for impertinence..... | 638 | 459 |
| Replication to joint answer of Standard Oil Co. of New Jersey <i>et al.</i> | 640 | 460 |
| Buffalo Natural Gas Fuel Co. <i>et al.</i> | 642 | 461 |
| Connecting Gas Co. <i>et al.</i> | 643 | 462 |
| Replication to answer of Corsicana Refining Co..... | 644 | 463 |
| Florence Oil and Refining Co..... | 645 | 463 |
| Manhattan Oil Co..... | 646 | 464 |
| Platt & Washburn Refining Co..... | 647 | 465 |
| Security Oil Co..... | 648 | 466 |
| Tide Water Oil Co..... | 649 | 466 |
| Tide Water Pipe Co..... | 650 | 467 |
| United Oil Co..... | 651 | 468 |
| Waters-Pierce Oil Co..... | 652 | 469 |
| Order setting exceptions and motions for argument..... | 653 | 469 |
| Order overruling exceptions to bill of complaint and granting time to answer, &c..... | 654 | 469 |
| Order appointing examiner, &c..... | 655 | 470 |
| Protest and exceptions to order overruling exceptions to bill of complaint..... | 658 | 472 |
| Additional answer of Standard Oil Company of New Jersey <i>et al.</i> | 661 | 473 |
| Replication to additional answer of Standard Oil Company of New Jersey <i>et al.</i> | 703 | 494 |
| Affidavit of service of notice of motion for appointment of special examiner..... | 706 | 495 |
| Notice of motion..... | 708 | 496 |
| Notice of petitioner's desire to take testimony orally and proof of service..... | 710 | 497 |
| Stipulation for appointment of additional examiner..... | 713 | 499 |
| Order appointing additional examiner..... | 714 | 500 |

| | Original. | Print |
|---|-----------|-------|
| Oath of office of additional examiner..... | 718 | 502 |
| Stipulation as to printing testimony..... | 719 | 503 |
| Stipulation as to time for proof..... | 720 | 504 |
| Order allowing time for proofs and setting cause for hearing..... | 721 | 505 |
| Notice, petition, and affidavits for extension of time for proofs..... | 722 | 505 |
| Affidavit of Moritz Rosenthal..... | 724 | 506 |
| Frank L. Crawford..... | 725 | 507 |
| Douglas Campbell..... | 729 | 510 |
| George H. Jones..... | 731 | 511 |
| W. Cleveland Runyon..... | 734 | 513 |
| George H. Jones..... | 735 | 514 |
| Stipulation for extension of time for proofs, &c..... | 739 | 517 |
| Order setting cause for hearing..... | 741 | 518 |
| Report of special examiner..... | 741 | 518 |
| Order as to publication of proofs..... | 743 | 519 |
| Stipulation as to testimony, &c..... | 744 | 520 |
| Hearing of cause commenced..... | 746 | 521 |
| Hearing of cause progressed.. | 746 | 521 |
| Hearing of cause concluded..... | 747 | 522 |
| Stipulations that any decree entered against defendants may also be entered against Security Oil Company and Manhattan Oil Company..... | 747 | 522 |
| Stipulation as to certain of petitioner's exhibits..... | 750 | 523 |
| Stipulation for allowance to special examiner..... | 750 | 524 |
| Order for allowance to special examiner..... | 752 | 524 |
| Decree..... | 753 | 525 |
| Order allowing appeal..... | 762 | 530 |
| Assignment of errors..... | 765 | 532 |
| Petition for appeal..... | 797 | 550 |
| Appeal bond..... | 800 | 553 |
| Stipulation as to certifying printed records and certain exhibits.... | 809 | 561 |
| Order as to certifying certain original exhibits and records..... | 811 | 562 |
| Opinion on motion to vacate order to bring in non-resident defendants, &c..... | 813 | 563 |
| Opinion on final decree..... | 820 | 570 |
| Concurring opinion of Hook, J..... | 850 | 587 |
| Citation..... | 857 | 591 |
| Acceptance of service of citation..... | 858 | 592 |
| Clerk's certificate to transcript of record..... | 859 | 592 |
| | | |
| Petitioner's testimony (in chief) (volumes to 1 to 6, inclusive)..... | pp. 1 to | 3335 |
| (Index in front of volume 1.) | | |
| Petitioner's exhibits (in chief) (volumes 7 to 10, inclusive)..... | pp. 1 to | 1922 |
| Defendants' testimony (volumes 11 to 17, inclusive)..... | pp. 1 to | 3672 |
| (Index in back of volume 17.) | | |
| Defendants' exhibits (volumes 18 and 19)..... | pp. 1 to | 993 |
| (Index in back of volume 19.) | | |
| Petitioner's testimony (in rebuttal) (volume 20)..... | pp. 1 to | 490 |
| Petitioner's exhibits (in rebuttal) (volume 21). | pp. 1 to | 385 |
| (Index to exhibits in back of volume 21.) | | |
| Petitioner's Exhibit—Transcript from supreme court of Ohio in the case of The State of Ohio <i>ex rel.</i> David K. Watson, attorney general, relator, <i>vs.</i> The Standard Oil Company (volume 22)..... | pp. 1 to | 524 |
| (Index in front.) | | |