

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**FILED**

JUL X 3 2012

**RICHARD W. WIEKING**  
CLERK, U.S. DISTRICT COURT  
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

IN RE: TFT-LCD (FLAT PANEL) ANTITRUST  
LITIGATION

No. M 07-1827 SI  
MDL No. 1827

**SPECIAL VERDICT**

\_\_\_\_\_ /  
This Order Relates To:

Direct-Purchaser Plaintiff Class Actions  
\_\_\_\_\_ /

We the jury unanimously find as follows on the questions submitted to us:

**Question 1:** Did plaintiffs prove, by a preponderance of the evidence and in accordance with the instructions given to you, that Toshiba knowingly participated in a conspiracy to fix, raise, maintain or stabilize the prices of TFT-LCD panels?

Yes  \_\_\_\_\_

No \_\_\_\_\_

If your answer to this question is "Yes," please answer the next question. If your answer to this question is "No," please go to the end of the verdict form, and sign and date it where indicated.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**Question 2:** Did plaintiffs prove, by a preponderance of the evidence and in accordance with the instructions given to you, that the conspiracy involved TFT-LCD panels and/or finished products (notebook computers, computer monitors and televisions containing TFT-LCD panels) imported into the United States?

Yes  \_\_\_\_\_ No \_\_\_\_\_

If your answer to this question is "Yes," please answer the next question. If your answer to this question is "No," please go to Question 4.

**Question 3:** Did plaintiffs prove, by a preponderance of the evidence and in accordance with the instructions given to you, that the conspiracy involving imported TFT-LCD panels and/or finished products (notebook computers, computer monitors and televisions containing TFT-LCD panels) produced substantial intended effects in the United States?

Yes  \_\_\_\_\_ No \_\_\_\_\_

Please answer the next question.

**Question 4:** Did plaintiffs prove, by a preponderance of the evidence and in accordance with the instructions given to you, that the conspiracy involved conduct which had a direct, substantial and reasonably foreseeable effect on trade or commerce in the United States?

Yes  \_\_\_\_\_ No \_\_\_\_\_

If your answer to either Question 3 or Question 4 is "Yes," please answer the next question. If your answer to both Question 3 and Question 4 is "No," please go to the end of the verdict form, and sign and date it where indicated.

1 **Question 5:** Did plaintiffs prove, by a preponderance of the evidence and in accordance with the  
2 instructions given to you, that members of the Panel Class were injured as a result of the conspiracy in  
3 which Toshiba knowingly participated?

4  
5 Yes  No

6  
7 If your answer to this question "Yes," please answer the next question. If your answer to this question  
8 is "No," please go to Question 7.

9 **Question 6:** What was the amount of damages the plaintiffs proved, by a preponderance of the evidence  
10 and in accordance with the instructions given to you, that members of the Panel Class suffered as a result  
11 of that injury?

12 \$ 17,000,000  
13 (Please fill in a dollar amount total)

14 Please answer the next question.

15 **Question 7:** Did plaintiffs prove, by a preponderance of the evidence and in accordance with the  
16 instructions given to you, that members of the Finished Product Class were injured as a result of the  
17 conspiracy in which Toshiba knowingly participated?

18  
19 Yes  No

20  
21 If your answer to this question "Yes," please answer the next question. If your answer to this question  
22 is "No," please go to the end of the verdict form, and sign and date it where indicated.

23 **Question 8:** What was the amount of damages the plaintiffs proved, by a preponderance of the evidence  
24 and in accordance with the instructions given to you, that members of the Finished Product Class  
25 suffered as a result of that injury?


26 \$ 70,000,000  
27 (Please fill in a dollar amount total)

28

**United States District Court  
For the Northern District of California**

- 1
- 2
- 3
- 4
- 5
- 6
- 7
- 8
- 9
- 10
- 11
- 12
- 13
- 14
- 15
- 16
- 17
- 18
- 19
- 20
- 21
- 22
- 23
- 24
- 25
- 26
- 27
- 28

Date: 3 July 2012

  
FOREPERSON