

CLOSED,CASREF,COMPLEX-CSMGMT,LEAD,RELATED

U.S. District Court
Southern District of New York (Foley Square)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG

In re: NYC Bus Tour Antitrust Litigation
Assigned to: Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr
Referred to: Magistrate Judge Gabriel W. Gorenstein
Related Case: [1:12-cv-08989-ALC-GWG](#)
Cause: 15:78m(a) Securities Exchange Act

Date Filed: 01/31/2013
Date Terminated: 08/02/2016
Jury Demand: Plaintiff
Nature of Suit: 410 Anti-Trust
Jurisdiction: Federal Question

Plaintiff

Natasha Bhandari

*on behalf of herself and all others similarly
situated*

represented by **Arun Srinivas Subramanian**
Susman Godfrey LLP (NYC)
1301 Avenue of the Americas, 32nd Floor
New York, NY 10019
(212) 336-8330
Fax: (212) 336-8340
Email:
asubramanian@susmangodfrey.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Drew D Hansen

Susman Godfrey LLP (Seattle)
1201 Third Avenue
Suite 3800
Seattle, WA 98101
(206)-516-3880
Fax: (206)-516-3883
Email: dhansen@susmangodfrey.com
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Mark Howard Hatch-Miller

Susman Godfrey LLP (NYC)
1301 Avenue of the Americas, 32nd Floor
New York, NY 10019
(212) 336-8330
Fax: (212) 336-8340
Email: mhatch-
miller@susmangodfrey.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Megan O'Hara Easley

Susman Godfrey LLP (NYC)
560 Lexington Avenue 15th Floor
New York, NY 10022
(212)-729-2006
Fax: (212)-336-8330
Email: measley@susmangodfrey.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Seth D. Ard
Susman Godfrey LLP (NYC)
1301 Avenue of the Americas, 32nd Floor
New York, NY 10019
(212)-336-8330
Fax: (212)-336-8340
Email: sard@susmangodfrey.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

William Christopher Carmody
Susman Godfrey LLP (NYC)
1301 Avenue of the Americas, 32nd Floor
New York, NY 10019
(212)-336-8330
Fax: (212)-336-8340
Email: bcarmody@susmangodfrey.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Consolidated Plaintiff

Mary Hanson

*on behalf of herself and all others similarly
situated*

Consolidated Plaintiff

Tracey L. Nobel

*on behalf of themselves and others
similarly situated*

represented by **Mark Howard Hatch-Miller**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Drew D Hansen
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Megan O'Hara Easley
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Seth D. Ard

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Consolidated Plaintiff

Stefanie Nocera

*on behalf of themselves and others
similarly situated*

Consolidated Plaintiff

Randy Hinton

*individually and on behalf of all others
similarly situated*

Consolidated Plaintiff

Suzanne Hinton

*individually and on behalf of all others
similarly situated*

Consolidated Plaintiff

Matthew Mercado

*On behalf of themselves and others
similarly situated*

Consolidated Plaintiff

Jeremiah Mercado

*On behalf of themselves and others
similarly situated*

V.

Defendant

Twin America, L.L.C.

represented by **Michael Paul Austern Cohen**

Paul Hastings Janofsky & Walker LLP

875 15th Street N.W.

Washington, DC 20005

(202)-551-1880

Fax: (202)-551-0280

Email: michaelcohen@paulhastings.com

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Holly Adele House

Paul Hastings LLP

55 Second St., Twenty-Fourth Flr.

San Francisco, CA 94105
(415)-856-7000
Fax: (415)-856-7100
Email: hollyhouse@paulhastings.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Thomas Patrick Brown
Paul Hastings LLP (CA2)
55 Second Street, Twenty-Fourth Floor
San Francisco, CA 94105
(415)-856-7248
Fax: (415)-856-7348
Email: tombrown@paulhastings.com
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Coach USA, Inc.

represented by **Alan M. Wiseman**
Covington & Burling, L.L.P. (DC)
One City Center, 850 10th Street NW
Washington, DC 20001
202-662-6000
Fax: (202)-662-6261
Email: awiseman@cov.com
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Andrew D. Lazerow
Covington & Burling, L.L.P. (DC)
One City Center, 850 10th Street NW
Washington, DC 20001
202-662-6000
Fax: 202-662-6291
Email: alazerow@cov.com
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ashley E. Bass
Covington & Burling, L.L.P. (DC)
One City Center, 850 10th Street NW
Washington, DC 20001
(202)-662-6000
Fax: (202)-662-6261
Email: abass@cov.com
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Thomas O. Barnett

Covington & Burling, L.L.P. (DC)
One City Center, 850 10th Street NW
Washington, DC 20001

(202)-662-6000

Fax: (202)-662-6261

Email: tbarnett@cov.com

PRO HAC VICE

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

International Bus Services, Inc.

represented by **Alan M. Wiseman**

(See above for address)

PRO HAC VICE

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Andrew D. Lazerow

(See above for address)

PRO HAC VICE

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ashley E. Bass

(See above for address)

PRO HAC VICE

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Thomas O. Barnett

(See above for address)

PRO HAC VICE

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

City Sights L.L.C.

represented by **Michael Paul Austern Cohen**

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Holly Adele House

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Thomas Patrick Brown

(See above for address)

PRO HAC VICE

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

City Sights Twin, LLCrepresented by **Michael Paul Austern Cohen**

(See above for address)

*LEAD ATTORNEY**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED***Holly Adele House**

(See above for address)

*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED***Thomas Patrick Brown**

(See above for address)

*PRO HAC VICE**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

| Date Filed | # | Docket Text |
|-------------------|--------------------------|---|
| 01/31/2013 | <u>1</u> | COMPLAINT against City Sights L.L.C., Coach USA, Inc., International Bus Services, Inc., Twin America, L.L.C. (Filing Fee \$ 350.00, Receipt Number 1059024) Document filed by Natasha Bhandari.(laq) (jd). (Entered: 02/01/2013) |
| 01/31/2013 | | SUMMONS ISSUED as to City Sights L.L.C., Coach USA, Inc., International Bus Services, Inc., Twin America, L.L.C. (laq) (Entered: 02/01/2013) |
| 01/31/2013 | | CASE REFERRED TO Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. as possibly related to 1:12-cv-8989. (laq) (Entered: 02/01/2013) |
| 01/31/2013 | <u>2</u> | STANDING ORDER IN RE PILOT PROJECT REGARDING CASE MANAGEMENT TECHNIQUES FOR COMPLEX CIVIL CASES IN THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK (See M-10-468 Order filed November 1, 2011). This case is hereby designated for inclusion in the Pilot Project Regarding Case Management Techniques for Complex Civil Cases in the Southern District of New York (the Pilot Project), unless the judge to whom this case is assigned determines otherwise. This case is designated for inclusion in the Pilot Project because it is a class action, an MDL action, or is in one of the following Nature of Suit categories: 160, 245, 315, 355, 365, 385, 410, 830, 840, 850, 893, or 950. The presiding judge in a case that does not otherwise qualify for inclusion in the Pilot Project may nevertheless designate the case for inclusion in the Pilot Project by issuing an order directing that the case be included in the Pilot Project. The description of the Pilot Project, including procedures to be followed, is attached to this Order. (Signed by Judge Loretta A. Preska on 10/31/11) (laq) (Entered: 02/01/2013) |
| 02/08/2013 | | CASE ACCEPTED AS RELATED. Create association to 1:12-cv-08989-ALC-GWG. Notice of Assignment to follow. (pgu) (Entered: 02/08/2013) |
| 02/08/2013 | <u>3</u> | NOTICE OF CASE ASSIGNMENT to Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. Judge Unassigned is no longer assigned to the case. (pgu) (Entered: 02/08/2013) |
| 02/08/2013 | | Magistrate Judge Gabriel W. Gorenstein is so designated. (pgu) (Entered: 02/08/2013) |

| | | |
|------------|--------------------|--|
| 02/08/2013 | | Mailed notice re: 3 Notice of Case Assignment/Reassignment to the attorney(s) of record. (pgu) (Entered: 02/08/2013) |
| 02/19/2013 | 4 | ORDER: The Court is in receipt of a letter dated February 15, 2013 seeking an initial conference in United States v. Twin America LLC et al., 12 Civ. 8989. The Court questions whether a conference should be held solely in 12 Civ. 8989 if parties to the other above- captioned cases will be seeking to consolidate their cases with 12 Civ. 8989 for discovery or pretrial purposes. If there were to be such consolidation, it would seem preferable for the Court to hold a single conference in which the attorneys on all cases participated. Accordingly, the parties to 12 Civ. 8989 are directed to confer with each other and then canvas the parties to the other cases to determine the parties' views on the question of consolidation. The results should be transmitted to the Court by letter- preferably a single letter, but multiple letters might be necessary if there are disagreements. If it seems simpler, the Court is prepared to hold a conference on the issue of consolidation on March 8, 2013 at 10:00 a.m. (to be attended by the parties to all cases). If there is universal agreement on consolidation, however, the March 8 conference could instead consist of the Initial Pretrial Conference contemplated by the Pilot Project Regarding Case Management Techniques for Complex Civil Cases. The Court will await the parties' views on consolidation before scheduling any conference. (Signed by Magistrate Judge Gabriel W. Gorenstein on 2/19/2013) (pl) (Entered: 02/19/2013) |
| 02/20/2013 | 5 | NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Mark Howard Hatch-Miller on behalf of Natasha Bhandari (Hatch-Miller, Mark) (Entered: 02/20/2013) |
| 02/20/2013 | 6 | ORDER OF REFERENCE TO A MAGISTRATE JUDGE. Order that case be referred to the Clerk of Court for assignment to a Magistrate Judge for General Pretrial (includes scheduling, discovery, non-dispositive pretrial motions, and settlement). Referred to Magistrate Judge Gabriel W. Gorenstein. (Signed by Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr on 2/20/2013) (cd) (Entered: 02/20/2013) |
| 02/21/2013 | 7 | AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE. Twin America, L.L.C. served on 2/8/2013, answer due 3/1/2013. Service was accepted by Miriam Peralta, Administrative Assistant. Document filed by Natasha Bhandari. (Subramanian, Arun) (Entered: 02/21/2013) |
| 02/21/2013 | 8 | AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE. City Sights L.L.C. served on 2/8/2013, answer due 3/1/2013. Service was accepted by Miriam Peralta, Administrative Assistant. Document filed by Natasha Bhandari. (Subramanian, Arun) (Entered: 02/21/2013) |
| 02/21/2013 | 9 | AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE. Coach USA, Inc. served on 2/8/2013, answer due 3/1/2013. Service was accepted by Christine Schulze, Authorized to Accept Service. Document filed by Natasha Bhandari. (Subramanian, Arun) (Entered: 02/21/2013) |
| 02/21/2013 | 10 | AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE. International Bus Services, Inc. served on 2/8/2013, answer due 3/1/2013. Service was accepted by James J. Murphy, Authorized to Accept Service. Document filed by Natasha Bhandari. (Subramanian, Arun) (Entered: 02/21/2013) |
| 02/21/2013 | 11 | AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE. City Sights Twin, LLC served on 2/8/2013, answer due 3/1/2013. Service was accepted by Denise "Doe," Person Apparently in Charge of Office. Document filed by Natasha Bhandari. (Subramanian, Arun) (Entered: 02/21/2013) |

| | | |
|------------|--------------------|---|
| | | 02/21/2013) |
| 02/22/2013 | 12 | ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Magistrate Judge Gabriel W. Gorenstein from Andrew A. Ruffino dated 2/20/2013 re: counsel for defendants respectfully request that the court grant the defendants an extension of time to respond to the complaints filed in these cases until 30 days after the plaintiffs collectively file their anticipated consolidated class action complaint. The current response deadline for these individual cases is February 28, which was set in response to a joint request from all parties. ENDORSEMENT: The defendants' time to answer is adjourned sine die pending the Court's consideration of the parties' proposals as to the issue of consolidation per the February 19, 2013 Order. (Signed by Magistrate Judge Gabriel W. Gorenstein on 2/21/2013) (pl) Modified on 2/22/2013 (pl). (Entered: 02/22/2013) |
| 02/27/2013 | 13 | ORDER: A conference will be held in 12 Civ. 8989 on March 8, 2013 at 10:00 a.m. in Courtroom 17-A, 500 Pearl Street, New York, New York. The conference will constitute the Initial Pretrial Conference as provided in the Pilot Project Regarding Case Management Techniques for Complex Civil Cases in the Southern District of New York. With respect to the remaining (i.e. non-8989) cases (the "private cases"), the Court believes that before it attempts to address the issue of whether discovery in the private cases should be "coordinated" with the 8989 case, the Court should first determine the question of who will act as lead (or "interim class") counsel for the private cases. The parties' proposed briefing schedule on this topic, as reflected in the February 26, 2013, letter, is adopted (that is, opening briefs due on March 12 2013, and responses due March 22, 2013). A conference at which the Court expects to decide the question of the appointment of lead (or "interim class") counsel will be held on March 28, 2013 at 4:00p.m. in Courtroom 17-A, 500 Pearl Street, New York, New York. The private plaintiffs are not required to attend the March 8 conference. Nonetheless, the Court would not prevent a private plaintiff from speaking at the March 8 conference if a request were to be made during the course of the conference to do so. (Signed by Magistrate Judge Gabriel W. Gorenstein on 2/27/2013) (pl) Modified on 2/27/2013 (pl). (Entered: 02/27/2013) |
| 02/27/2013 | | Set/Reset Deadlines: (Brief due by 3/12/2013.), Set/Reset Hearings:(Initial Conference set for 3/8/2013 at 10:00 AM before Magistrate Judge Gabriel W. Gorenstein., Status Conference set for 3/28/2013 at 04:00 PM in Courtroom 17A, 500 Pearl Street, New York, NY 10007 before Magistrate Judge Gabriel W. Gorenstein.) (pl) Modified on 2/28/2013 (pl). (Entered: 02/27/2013) |
| 02/28/2013 | | Received returned mail re: 3 Notice of Case Assignment/Reassignment. Mail was addressed to Arun Srinivas Subramanian of Susman Godfrey LLP (NYC) at 654 Madison Avenue, New York, NY, 10065 and was returned for the following reason(s): Return to sender. (pgu) (Entered: 02/28/2013) |
| 02/28/2013 | | Received returned mail re: 3 Notice of Case Assignment/Reassignment. Mail was addressed to William Christopher Carmody of Susman Godfrey LLP (NYC) at 654 Madison Avenue, New York, NY, 10065 and was returned for the following reason(s): Return to sender. (pgu) (Entered: 02/28/2013) |
| 02/28/2013 | 14 | NOTICE OF CHANGE OF ADDRESS by Arun Srinivas Subramanian on behalf of Natasha Bhandari. New Address: Susman Godfrey, LLP, 560 Lexington Avenue, 15th |

| | | |
|------------|--------------------|--|
| | | Floor, New York, New York, 10022-6828, 212-336-8330. (Subramanian, Arun) (Entered: 02/28/2013) |
| 02/28/2013 | 15 | NOTICE OF CHANGE OF ADDRESS by Arun Srinivas Subramanian on behalf of Natasha Bhandari. New Address: Susman Godfrey, LLP, 560 Lexington Avenue, 15th Floor, New York, New York, 10022-6828, 212-336-8330. (Subramanian, Arun) (Entered: 02/28/2013) |
| 03/01/2013 | 16 | NOTICE OF CHANGE OF ADDRESS by William Christopher Carmody on behalf of Natasha Bhandari. New Address: Susman Godfrey, LLP, 560 Lexington Avenue, 15th Floor, New York, New York, 10022-6828, 212-336-8330. (Carmody, William) (Entered: 03/01/2013) |
| 03/12/2013 | 17 | MOTION to Appoint Counsel <i>Notice of Motion and Motion of Plaintiff Natasha Bhandari for Appointment of Interim Class Counsel</i> . Document filed by Natasha Bhandari.(Hatch-Miller, Mark) (Entered: 03/12/2013) |
| 03/12/2013 | 18 | MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: 17 MOTION to Appoint Counsel <i>Notice of Motion and Motion of Plaintiff Natasha Bhandari for Appointment of Interim Class Counsel</i> .. Document filed by Natasha Bhandari. (Hatch-Miller, Mark) (Entered: 03/12/2013) |
| 03/12/2013 | 19 | DECLARATION of William Christopher Carmody in Support re: 17 MOTION to Appoint Counsel <i>Notice of Motion and Motion of Plaintiff Natasha Bhandari for Appointment of Interim Class Counsel</i> .. Document filed by Natasha Bhandari. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit A, # 2 Exhibit B, # 3 Exhibit C, # 4 Exhibit D, # 5 Exhibit E)(Hatch-Miller, Mark) (Entered: 03/12/2013) |
| 03/13/2013 | 20 | DECLARATION of Mark Howard Hatch-Miller in Support re: 17 MOTION to Appoint Counsel <i>Notice of Motion and Motion of Plaintiff Natasha Bhandari for Appointment of Interim Class Counsel</i> .. Document filed by Natasha Bhandari. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit Exhibit A - Proposed First Amended Complaint)(Hatch-Miller, Mark) (Entered: 03/13/2013) |
| 03/13/2013 | 21 | NOTICE of Service re: 17 MOTION to Appoint Counsel <i>Notice of Motion and Motion of Plaintiff Natasha Bhandari for Appointment of Interim Class Counsel</i> .. Document filed by Natasha Bhandari. (Hatch-Miller, Mark) (Entered: 03/13/2013) |
| 03/13/2013 | 22 | CLASS ACTION COMPLAINT amending 1 Complaint against City Sights L.L.C., City Sights Twin, LLC, Coach USA, Inc., International Bus Services, Inc., Twin America, L.L.C. with JURY DEMAND. Document filed by Natasha Bhandari. Related document: 1 Complaint filed by Natasha Bhandari.(djc) (Entered: 03/20/2013) |
| 03/21/2013 | 23 | MOTION for Ashley E. Bass to Appear Pro Hac Vice. Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number 0208-8345876. Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff. Document filed by Coach USA, Inc., International Bus Services, Inc..(Bass, Ashley) (Entered: 03/21/2013) |
| 03/21/2013 | 24 | MOTION for Andrew D. Lazerow to Appear Pro Hac Vice. Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number 0208-8346108. Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff. Document filed by Coach USA, Inc., International Bus Services, |

| | | |
|------------|--------------------|--|
| | | Inc..(Lazerow, Andrew) (Entered: 03/21/2013) |
| 03/21/2013 | 25 | MOTION for Alan M. Wiseman to Appear Pro Hac Vice. Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number 0208-8346227. Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff. Document filed by Coach USA, Inc., International Bus Services, Inc..(Wiseman, Alan) (Entered: 03/21/2013) |
| 03/21/2013 | 26 | MOTION for Thomas O. Barnett to Appear Pro Hac Vice. Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number 0208-8346303. Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff. Document filed by Coach USA, Inc., International Bus Services, Inc..(Barnett, Thomas) (Entered: 03/21/2013) |
| 03/21/2013 | | >>>NOTICE REGARDING PRO HAC VICE MOTION. Regarding Document No. 24 MOTION for Andrew D. Lazerow to Appear Pro Hac Vice. Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number 0208-8346108. Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff., 25 MOTION for Alan M. Wiseman to Appear Pro Hac Vice. Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number 0208-8346227. Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff., 23 MOTION for Ashley E. Bass to Appear Pro Hac Vice. Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number 0208-8345876. Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff., 26 MOTION for Thomas O. Barnett to Appear Pro Hac Vice. Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number 0208-8346303. Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff.. The document has been reviewed and there are no deficiencies. (bcu) (Entered: 03/21/2013) |
| 03/22/2013 | 27 | ORDER granting 23 Motion for Ashley E. Bass to Appear Pro Hac Vice (HEREBY ORDERED by Magistrate Judge Gabriel W. Gorenstein)(Text Only Order) (Gorenstein, Gabriel) (Entered: 03/22/2013) |
| 03/22/2013 | 28 | ORDER granting 24 Motion for Andrew D. Lazerow to Appear Pro Hac Vice (HEREBY ORDERED by Magistrate Judge Gabriel W. Gorenstein)(Text Only Order) (Gorenstein, Gabriel) (Entered: 03/22/2013) |
| 03/22/2013 | 29 | ORDER granting 25 Motion for Alan M. Wiseman to Appear Pro Hac Vice (HEREBY ORDERED by Magistrate Judge Gabriel W. Gorenstein)(Text Only Order) (Gorenstein, Gabriel) (Entered: 03/22/2013) |
| 03/22/2013 | 30 | ORDER granting 26 Motion for Thomas O. Barnett to Appear Pro Hac Vice (HEREBY ORDERED by Magistrate Judge Gabriel W. Gorenstein)(Text Only Order) (Gorenstein, Gabriel) (Entered: 03/22/2013) |
| 03/22/2013 | 31 | RESPONSE in Support re: 17 MOTION to Appoint Counsel <i>Notice of Motion and Motion of Plaintiff Natasha Bhandari for Appointment of Interim Class Counsel. Response of Plaintiff Natasha Bhandari to Motion for Consolidation and Appointment of Lowey Dannenberg Cohen & Hart, PC as Interim Class Counsel.</i> Document filed by Natasha Bhandari. (Hatch-Miller, Mark) (Entered: 03/22/2013) |
| 03/22/2013 | 32 | DECLARATION of Mark Howard Hatch-Miller in Support re: 17 MOTION to Appoint Counsel <i>Notice of Motion and Motion of Plaintiff Natasha Bhandari for Appointment of Interim Class Counsel.</i> Document filed by Natasha Bhandari. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit A, # 2 Exhibit B, # 3 Exhibit C)(Hatch-Miller, Mark) |

| | | |
|------------|--------------------|--|
| | | (Entered: 03/22/2013) |
| 03/22/2013 | 33 | CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE. Document filed by Natasha Bhandari. (Hatch-Miller, Mark) (Entered: 03/22/2013) |
| 03/25/2013 | 34 | ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Magistrate Judge Gabriel W. Gorenstein from Jeanne D'Esposito dated 3/25/13 re: counsel for Plaintiff respectfully requests that the Court adjourn the hearing on the Motion for Consolidation and the Appointment of Interim Class Counsel, currently scheduled for March 28, 2013 at 4 p.m. The Deputy Clerk has advised that the Court is available for a rescheduled hearing on Friday, April 5 at 10:00 a.m. and that date is acceptable to all parties. ENDORSEMENT: Granted. (Signed by Magistrate Judge Gabriel W. Gorenstein on 3/25/2013) (pl) Modified on 3/25/2013 (pl). (Entered: 03/25/2013) |
| 03/25/2013 | | Set/Reset Hearings: Status Conference set for 4/5/2013 at 10:00 AM before Magistrate Judge Gabriel W. Gorenstein. (pl) (Entered: 03/25/2013) |
| 03/26/2013 | 35 | CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE. City Sights L.L.C. served on 3/21/2013, answer due 4/11/2013; City Sights Twin, LLC served on 3/21/2013, answer due 4/11/2013; Coach USA, Inc. served on 3/21/2013, answer due 4/11/2013; International Bus Services, Inc. served on 3/21/2013, answer due 4/11/2013; Twin America, L.L.C. served on 3/21/2013, answer due 4/11/2013. Service was made by Electronic Mail. Document filed by Natasha Bhandari. (Hatch-Miller, Mark) (Entered: 03/26/2013) |
| 04/05/2013 | 36 | ORDER granting 17 Motion to Appoint Counsel. For the reasons stated today on the record, the motion in Hanson v. Twin America, LLC (Docket # 20 in 12 Civ. 9066) for the appointment of Lowey Dannenberg Cohen & Hart, PC as interim class counsel is denied. The motion in Bhandari v. Twin America, LLC (Docket # 17 in 13 Civ. 0711) for the designation of Susman Godfrey LLP as interim class counsel is granted. The Court designates the firm of Susman Godfrey LLP as Interim Class Counsel for these cases pursuant to Rule 23(g) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. (Signed by Magistrate Judge Gabriel W. Gorenstein on 4/5/2013) (pl) (Entered: 04/05/2013) |
| 04/23/2013 | 37 | MOTION to Consolidate Cases 13-cv-711, 12-cv-9066, 12-cv-9128, 12-cv-9175, 13-cv-1973 <i>and to Set Initial Schedule</i> . Document filed by Natasha Bhandari. (Attachments: # 1 Text of Proposed Order Consolidating Cases and Setting Initial Schedule)(Hatch-Miller, Mark) (Entered: 04/23/2013) |
| 04/24/2013 | 38 | ORDER granting 37 Motion to Consolidate Cases. That pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 42(a)(2), the above-captioned related cases are consolidated under Docket No. 13-cv-0711 for all purposes, including trial. Susman Godfrey LLP ("Interim Class Counsel") shall file a consolidated class action complaint on or before April 26, 2013. (b) Interim Class Counsel and counsel for defendants shall participate in a conference pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(f) and the Pilot Project Standing Order (Docket No. 2) within 14 days after Interim Class Counsel files a consolidated class action complaint. (c) Defendants shall file an answer to the consolidated class action complaint or, in the event they intend to file a motion to dismiss, a pre-motion conference letter with the Court pursuant to Rule 2(A) of the Court's Individual Practices, within 21 days after Interim Class Counsel files a consolidated class action complaint. Interim Class Counsel and counsel for defendants |

| | | |
|------------|--------------------|--|
| | | request the Court schedule the Initial Pretrial Case Management Conference pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 16, Rule 3(B) of the Court's Individual Practices, and Part I.B of the Pilot Project Standing Order, for a date between May 21-23, 2013. ENDORSEMENT: 3. This resolves docket #37 in 13cv7011. The parties should present an order to the Court setting up a master docket and a single caption for the consolidated cases. (Signed by Magistrate Judge Gabriel W. Gorenstein on 4/23/2013) (pl) Modified on 4/24/2013 (pl). (Entered: 04/24/2013) |
| 04/24/2013 | | Set/Reset Deadlines: Amended Pleadings due by 4/26/2013. (pl) (Entered: 04/24/2013) |
| 04/26/2013 | 39 | ORDER DESIGNATING MASTER DOCKET AND CASE FILE NUMBER AND ESTABLISHING PROCEDURES FOR SUBSEQUENT RELATED ACTIONS: The Clerk will maintain a Master Docket under the style "In re NYC Bus Tour Antitrust Litigation" as Master Case File Number 13-CV-0711. The original of this Order shall be filed by the Clerk on the Master Docket. Separate dockets shall also be maintained for each of the Consolidated Actions, and entries shall be made therein in accordance with the Clerk's regular procedures, except as modified by this Order. Orders, pleadings, motions, and other documents bearing the caption "In re NYC Bus Tour Antitrust Litigation," when docketed and filed under the Master Case File Number, will be deemed to have been filed in each individual case to the extent applicable and will not be separately docketed or physically filed in such individual cases. All orders, pleadings, motions, and other documents in the Consolidated Actions shall bear the caption "In re NYC Bus Tour Antitrust Litigation." If generally applicable to all of the Consolidated actions, they shall include in the caption the notation that they relate to "ALL CASES" and be filed and docketed only on the Master Docket. The Order appointing Interim Class Counsel, ECF No. 36, the consolidation Order, ECF No. 38, and this Order shall govern all Subsequent Related Actions, unless a party to such a Subsequent Related Action files an application for relief on the Master Docket within fifteen (15) days after the date of the Master Docket entry reflecting the filing of such Subsequent Related Action. Additional relief as set forth in this Order. (Signed by Magistrate Judge Gabriel W. Gorenstein on 4/26/2013) (pl) (Entered: 04/26/2013) |
| 04/26/2013 | 40 | CONSOLIDATED CLASS ACTION COMPLAINT against City Sights L.L.C., City Sights Twin, LLC, Coach USA, Inc., International Bus Services, Inc., Twin America, L.L.C. with JURY DEMAND.Document filed by Natasha Bhandari. ***This relates to all cases. (mro) (mt). (Entered: 04/29/2013) |
| 04/29/2013 | | ***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO E-MAIL PDF. Note to Attorney Mark Howard Hatch-Miller for noncompliance with Section 14.3 of the S.D.N.Y. Electronic Case Filing Rules & Instructions. E-MAIL the PDF for Document 40 Amended Complaint to: caseopenings@nysd.uscourts.gov. (mro) (Entered: 04/29/2013) |
| 04/29/2013 | 41 | ORDER: A initial case management conference is scheduled for Tuesday, 5/21/2013 at 02:30 PM in Courtroom 17A, 500 Pearl Street, New York, NY. The parties should present to the Court, either at or shortly before the conference, a joint proposed order regarding case scheduling (or, in the event of disagreement, competing proposals). (Signed by Magistrate Judge Gabriel W. Gorenstein on 4/29/2013) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128- |

| | | |
|------------|--------------------|--|
| | | ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(sac) (Entered: 04/29/2013) |
| 05/01/2013 | 42 | CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE. City Sights L.L.C. served on 4/26/2013, answer due 5/17/2013; City Sights Twin, LLC served on 4/26/2013, answer due 5/17/2013; Coach USA, Inc. served on 4/26/2013, answer due 5/17/2013; International Bus Services, Inc. served on 4/26/2013, answer due 5/17/2013; Twin America, L.L.C. served on 4/26/2013, answer due 5/17/2013. Service was made by Electronic Mail. Document filed by Tracey L. Nobel; Suzanne Hinton; Matthew Mercado; Natasha Bhandari; Jeremiah Mercado; Randy Hinton; Mary Hanson; Stefanie Nocera. Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(Hatch-Miller, Mark) (Entered: 05/01/2013) |
| 05/15/2013 | 43 | MOTION for Thomas P. Brown to Appear Pro Hac Vice. Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number 0208-8513114. Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff. Document filed by City Sights L.L.C., City Sights Twin, LLC, Twin America, L.L.C.. (Attachments: # 1 Certificate of Good Standing, # 2 Text of Proposed Order)(Brown, Thomas) (Entered: 05/15/2013) |
| 05/15/2013 | | >>>NOTICE REGARDING PRO HAC VICE MOTION. Regarding Document No. 43 MOTION for Thomas P. Brown to Appear Pro Hac Vice. Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number 0208-8513114. Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff.. The document has been reviewed and there are no deficiencies. (bcu) (Entered: 05/15/2013) |
| 05/16/2013 | 44 | ORDER in case 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG; granting (43) Motion for Thomas P. Brown to Appear Pro Hac Vice in case 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG; granting <input type="checkbox"/> Motion for Thomas P. Brown to Appear Pro Hac Vice in case 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG; granting <input type="checkbox"/> Motion for Thomas P. Brown to Appear Pro Hac Vice in case 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG; granting <input type="checkbox"/> Motion for Thomas P. Brown to Appear Pro Hac Vice in case 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG; granting <input type="checkbox"/> Motion for Thomas P. Brown to Appear Pro Hac Vice in case 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG (HEREBY ORDERED by Magistrate Judge Gabriel W. Gorenstein)(Text Only Order) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(Gorenstein, Gabriel) (Entered: 05/16/2013) |
| 05/17/2013 | 45 | ANSWER to 40 Amended Complaint,. Document filed by City Sights L.L.C., City Sights Twin, LLC, Twin America, L.L.C..(Cohen, Michael) (Entered: 05/17/2013) |
| 05/17/2013 | 46 | RULE 7.1 CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENT. Identifying Other Affiliate Stagecoach Group Plc., Other Affiliate International Bus Services, Inc. for Coach USA, Inc.. Document filed by Coach USA, Inc., International Bus Services, Inc..(Barnett, Thomas) (Entered: 05/17/2013) |
| 05/17/2013 | 47 | ANSWER to 40 Amended Complaint,. Document filed by Coach USA, Inc., International Bus Services, Inc..(Barnett, Thomas) (Entered: 05/17/2013) |
| 05/21/2013 | | Minute Entry for proceedings held before Magistrate Judge Gabriel W. Gorenstein: Initial Pretrial Conference held on 5/21/2013. (cd) (Entered: 05/23/2013) |

| | | |
|------------|--------------------|---|
| 05/28/2013 | 48 | TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: Status Conference held on 5/21/2013 before Magistrate Judge Gabriel W. Gorenstein. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Ruth Ann Hager. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 6/21/2013. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 7/1/2013. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 8/29/2013.(sdi) (Entered: 05/28/2013) |
| 05/28/2013 | 49 | NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a Status Conference proceeding held on 5/21/2013 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...(sdi) (Entered: 05/28/2013) |
| 05/31/2013 | 50 | PROTECTIVE ORDER...regarding procedures to be followed that shall govern the handling of confidential material... (Signed by Magistrate Judge Gabriel W. Gorenstein on 5/31/2013) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(lmb) (Entered: 05/31/2013) |
| 06/05/2013 | 51 | SCHEDULING ORDER: Motions due by 9/27/2013. Responses due by 10/25/2013. Replies due by 11/8/2013. Deposition due by 4/25/2014. Fact Discovery due by 1/31/2014. (Signed by Magistrate Judge Gabriel W. Gorenstein on 6/4/2013) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(lmb) (Entered: 06/05/2013) |
| 06/06/2013 | 52 | ORDER: 1. The above-referenced action has been referred to the undersigned for general pre-trial purposes. See 28 U.S.C. § 636(b)(1)(A). All pre-trial applications, including those relating to scheduling and discovery, shall be made to the undersigned (except motions to dismiss or for judgment on the pleadings, for injunctive relief, for summary judgment, or for class certification). All applications must comply with this Court's Individual Practices, which are available through the Clerk's Office or at: http://www.nysd.uscourts.gov/judge/Gorenstein . 2. All discovery (including requests for admissions) must be initiated in time to be concluded by the deadline for all discovery. 3. Discovery motions -- that is, any application pursuant to Rules 26 through 37 or 45 - not only must comply with 2.A. of the Court's Individual Practices but also must be made promptly after the cause for such a motion arises. In addition, absent extraordinary circumstances no such application will be considered if made later than 30 days prior to the close of discovery. Untimely applications will be denied 4. Any application for an extension of the time limitations with respect to any deadlines in this matter must be made as soon as the cause for the extension becomes known to the party making the application and must be made in accordance with 1.E of the Court's Individual Practices. The application must state the position of all other parties on the proposed extension and must show good cause therefore not foreseeable as of the date of this Order. "Good cause" as used in this paragraph does not include circumstances within the control of counsel or the party. Any application not in |

| | | |
|------------|--------------------|--|
| | | compliance with this paragraph will be denied. Failure to comply with the terms of this Order may also result in sanctions. 5. If a recipient of this Order is aware of any attorneys or parties who should receive notice of Court action in this case other than any attorneys or parties currently listed on the ECF system, please notify Deputy Clerk Sylvia Gonzalez at (212) 805-4260 immediately. (Signed by Magistrate Judge Gabriel W. Gorenstein on 6/6/2013) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(lmb) Modified on 6/6/2013 (lmb). Modified on 6/7/2013 (lmb). (Entered: 06/06/2013) |
| 08/26/2013 | 53 | FILING ERROR - DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY - MOTION for Drew D. Hansen to Appear Pro Hac Vice. Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number 0208-8816840. Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff. Document filed by Natasha Bhandari. (Attachments: # 1 Text of Proposed Order)(Hansen, Drew) Modified on 8/27/2013 (bcu). (Entered: 08/26/2013) |
| 08/27/2013 | | >>>NOTICE REGARDING DEFICIENT MOTION TO APPEAR PRO HAC VICE. Notice regarding Document No. 53 MOTION for Drew D. Hansen to Appear Pro Hac Vice. Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number 0208-8816840. Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff.. The filing is deficient for the following reason(s): Missing Certificate of Good Standing. Re-file the document as a Corrected Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice and attach a valid Certificate of Good Standing, issued within the past 30 days. (bcu) (Entered: 08/27/2013) |
| 08/27/2013 | 54 | AMENDED MOTION for Drew D. Hansen to Appear Pro Hac Vice. Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff. Document filed by Natasha Bhandari. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit Certificate of Good Standing, # 2 Text of Proposed Order)(Hansen, Drew) (Entered: 08/27/2013) |
| 08/27/2013 | | >>>NOTICE REGARDING PRO HAC VICE MOTION. Regarding Document No. 54 AMENDED MOTION for Drew D. Hansen to Appear Pro Hac Vice. Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff.. The document has been reviewed and there are no deficiencies. (bcu) (Entered: 08/27/2013) |
| 09/06/2013 | 55 | CONSENT MOTION for Extension of Time to File <i>Motion for Class Certification</i> . Document filed by Natasha Bhandari. (Attachments: # 1 [Proposed] Amended Scheduling Order)(Hatch-Miller, Mark) (Entered: 09/06/2013) |
| 09/09/2013 | 56 | STIPULATION AND ORDER CONCERNING TESTIFYING EXPERT DISCOVERY: The parties stipulate to the following regarding the scope of testifying expert discovery in the above-captioned matter: The provisions of Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(b)(4)(C), as modified or limited herein, will apply to expert discovery in this action. No party may seek discovery of, and no expert or party is required to produce or describe on a privilege log: i. any written or oral communication between an expert (including his or her assistants, employees, or agents) and a party offering the testimony of such expert (including the party's employees, agents, consultants, and counsel, and their employees or agents); ii. any written or oral communication between an expert and his or her employees, assistants, or agents; iii. drafts of any |

| | | |
|------------|--------------------|---|
| | | <p>report, exhibit, study, work paper, computation, calculation, compilation, or any other material prepared by, for, or at the direction of an expert, regardless of the form in which the draft is recorded; or iv. any notes or other writings made by, for, or at the direction of an expert. Notwithstanding the preceding paragraph, the parties may obtain discovery of any documents or other written material upon which the expert relies for his or her opinions. All other communications, notes, drafts, and other materials by, between, involving, or reviewed by the expert and/or his or her staff shall not be discoverable. (Signed by Magistrate Judge Gabriel W. Gorenstein on 9/9/2013) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(rsh) (Entered: 09/09/2013)</p> |
| 09/09/2013 | 57 | <p>MEMORANDUM on AMENDED SCHEDULING ORDER: The following amended schedule shall govern this case. CLASS CERTIFICATION. If plaintiff wishes to serve an expert report at the class certification stage, plaintiff shall disclose the identity of any expert on September 6, 2013. Plaintiff shall file a motion for class certification and serve any such expert report on September 30, 2013. Defendants shall disclose the identity of any expert relating to class certification issues on October 4, 2013. Defendants shall file a class certification response brief and serve any such expert report on October 28, 2013. Plaintiff shall file a class certification reply brief on November 11, 2013. Plaintiff may seek leave from the Court to serve an expert report with its reply brief. Defendants reserve their right to oppose any such application. FACT DISCOVERY. All fact discovery shall be completed by January 31, 2014. EXPERT DISCOVERY. Plaintiff shall disclose the identities of any other expert witnesses and serve such experts' written reports on February 28, 2014. Defendants shall disclose the identities of any other expert witnesses and serve such experts' written reports on March 28, 2014. The deadline for deposing plaintiff's and defendants' expert witnesses shall be April 25, 2014. It is further provided that defendants shall have the right to take the deposition(s) of any plaintiff's expert(s) at least 7 days prior to the deposition(s) of defendants' expert(s). SUMMARY JUDGMENT. The deadline for defendants to submit a letter to Judge Carter requesting a pre-motion conference regarding a contemplated summary judgment motion shall be May 16, 2014. ENDORSEMENT: Docket #55 is granted. in case 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG; granting (55) Motion for Extension of Time to File in case 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG; granting <input type="checkbox"/> Motion for Extension of Time to File in case 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG; granting <input type="checkbox"/> Motion for Extension of Time to File in case 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG; granting <input type="checkbox"/> Motion for Extension of Time to File in case 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG; granting <input type="checkbox"/> Motion for Extension of Time to File in case 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG (Signed by Magistrate Judge Gabriel W. Gorenstein on 9/9/2013) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(rsh) (Entered: 09/09/2013)</p> |
| 09/09/2013 | | <p>Set/Reset Deadlines: Deposition due by 4/25/2014. Fact Discovery due by 1/31/2014. Motions due by 9/30/2013. Responses due by 10/28/2013 Replies due by 11/11/2013. Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(rsh) (Entered: 09/09/2013)</p> |

| | | |
|------------|--------------------|--|
| 09/20/2013 | 58 | ORDER in case 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG; granting (54) Motion for Drew D. Hansen to Appear Pro Hac Vice in case 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG; granting [] Motion for Drew D. Hansen to Appear Pro Hac Vice in case 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG; granting [] Motion for Drew D. Hansen to Appear Pro Hac Vice in case 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG; granting [] Motion for Drew D. Hansen to Appear Pro Hac Vice in case 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG; granting [] Motion for Drew D. Hansen to Appear Pro Hac Vice in case 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG (HEREBY ORDERED by Magistrate Judge Gabriel W. Gorenstein)(Text Only Order) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(Gorenstein, Gabriel) (Entered: 09/20/2013) |
| 09/25/2013 | 59 | MOTION for Extension of Time <i>to File Motion for Class Certification</i> . Document filed by Natasha Bhandari. (Attachments: # 1 Text of Proposed Order)(Hatch-Miller, Mark) (Entered: 09/25/2013) |
| 09/25/2013 | 60 | AMENDED SCHEDULING ORDER in case 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG; granting (59) Motion for Extension of Time. Deposition due by 4/25/2014., Motions due by 10/21/2013., Reply to Response to Brief due by 12/9/2013., Responses to Brief due by 11/20/2013 and All fact discovery shall be completed by January 31, 2014. in case 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG; granting [] Motion for Extension of Time in case 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG; granting [] Motion for Extension of Time in case 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG; granting [] Motion for Extension of Time in case 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG; granting [] Motion for Extension of Time in case 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG. (Signed by Magistrate Judge Gabriel W. Gorenstein on 9/25/2013) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(rsh). Modified on 10/1/2013 (rsh). (Entered: 09/25/2013) |
| 09/25/2013 | | Set/Reset Deadlines: Fact Discovery due by 1/31/2014. Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(rsh) Modified on 9/26/2013 (rsh). (Entered: 09/25/2013) |
| 10/07/2013 | 61 | STIPULATED AGREEMENT AND ORDER REGARDING PRESERVATION OF PRIVILEGE CLAIMS regarding procedures to be followed that shall govern the handling of confidential material. Plaintiff Natasha Bhandari and Defendants Twin America, LLC, CitySights LLC, City Sights Twin, LLC, Coach USA, Inc. and International Bus Services, Inc., acting through their counsel of record, agree to adhere to the following procedures with regard to the inadvertent production of privileged or protected material produced as part of discovery in the above captioned litigation. (Signed by Magistrate Judge Gabriel W. Gorenstein on 10/7/2013) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(rsh) (Entered: 10/07/2013) |
| 10/14/2013 | 62 | CONSENT MOTION to Amend/Correct 60 Order on Motion for Extension of Time,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,, <i>Consent Motion to Amend Scheduling Order</i> . Document filed by Natasha Bhandari. (Attachments: # 1 Text of Proposed Order)(Hansen, Drew) |

| | | |
|------------|--------------------|---|
| | | (Entered: 10/14/2013) |
| 10/15/2013 | 63 | ORDER granting AMENDED SCHEDULING ORDER (62) Motion to Amend/Correct in case 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG. Plaintiff shall serve an unredacted version of their motion for class certification and any such expert report on Defendants on October 21, 2013, and file a sealing request along with proposed redactions to the motion for class certification and any such expert report with the Court on October 22, 2013. Defendants shall disclose the identity of any expert relating to class certification issues on October 28, 2013. Defendants shall serve an unredacted version of their class certification response brief and any such expert report on Plaintiffs on November 20, 2013, and file a sealing request along with proposed redactions to their class certification response brief and any such expert report with the Court on November 21, 2013. Plaintiff shall serve an unredacted version of their class certification reply brief on Defendants on December 9, 2013, and if necessary, file a sealing request along with proposed redactions to the reply brief with the Court on December 10. Plaintiff may seek leave from the Court to serve an expert report with its reply brief. Defendants reserve their right to oppose any such application. All fact discovery shall be completed by January 31, 2014. Plaintiff shall disclose the identities of any other expert witnesses and serve such experts' written reports on February 28, 2014. Defendants shall disclose the identities of any other expert witnesses and serve such experts' written reports on March 28, 2014. The deadline for deposing Plaintiffs and defendants' expert witnesses shall be April 25, 2014. It is further provided that Defendants shall have the right to take the deposition(s) of any Plaintiff's expert(s) at least 7 days prior to the deposition(s) of Defendants' expert(s). The deadline for Defendants to submit a letter to Judge Carter requesting a pre-motion conference regarding a contemplated summary judgment motion shall be May 16, 2014. granting [] Motion to Amend/Correct in case 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG; granting [] Motion to Amend/Correct in case 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG; granting [] Motion to Amend/Correct in case 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG; granting [] Motion to Amend/Correct in case 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG. (Signed by Magistrate Judge Gabriel W. Gorenstein on 10/15/2013) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(rsh) Modified on 10/16/2013 (rsh). (Entered: 10/15/2013) |
| 10/22/2013 | 64 | MOTION to Seal. Document filed by Natasha Bhandari. (Attachments: # 1 Text of Proposed Order)(Hansen, Drew) (Entered: 10/22/2013) |
| 10/22/2013 | | Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr: Telephone Conference held on 10/22/2013. Drew Hansen and Jordan Connors for Plaintiff. Ryan Decker for Defendants Twin City and City Sights. Andrew Lazerow and Ashley Bass for Defendants Coach and International Bus Services. Plaintiff to provide the Court via email with a copy of its unredacted motion. The parties are to meet and confer re: proposed redactions. Telephone Conference set for 10/31/2013 at 3:00 p.m. Court Reporter: Bill Richards. (tdh) (Entered: 10/23/2013) |
| 10/23/2013 | 65 | ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Magistrate Judge Gabriel W. Gorenstein from William Christopher Carmody dated 10/22/2013 re: I write as counsel for plaintiff Natasha Bhandari to request a pre-motion conference regarding a motion to amend the |

| | | |
|------------|--------------------|---|
| | | current complaint in this matter. ENDORSEMENT: The pre-motion conference requirement is waived. Please check with defendants to see if they will simply stipulate to the filing of the proposed amended pleading. The Court notes that the consideration of the "futility" of a proposed amendment to a pleading is addressed to a court's "discretion," <i>Grace v. Rosenstock</i> , 228 F.3d 40, 53 (2d Cir. 2000), and if this is the only basis defendants have for opposing the amendment, it would be best to stipulate to its filing. By doing so, defendants will preserve any arguments about the merits of the claims for any future motion that addresses the merits. (Signed by Magistrate Judge Gabriel W. Gorenstein on 10/23/2013) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(rsh) (Entered: 10/23/2013) |
| 10/30/2013 | 66 | MOTION for Holly A. House to Appear Pro Hac Vice. Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number 0208-9029926. Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff. Document filed by City Sights L.L.C., City Sights Twin, LLC, Twin America, L.L.C.. (Attachments: # 1 Certificate of Good Standing, # 2 Text of Proposed Order)(House, Holly) (Entered: 10/30/2013) |
| 10/30/2013 | | >>>NOTICE REGARDING PRO HAC VICE MOTION. Regarding Document No. 66 MOTION for Holly A. House to Appear Pro Hac Vice. Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number 0208-9029926. Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff.. The document has been reviewed and there are no deficiencies. (wb) (Entered: 10/30/2013) |
| 10/31/2013 | 67 | ORDER granting 66 Motion for Holly A. House to Appear Pro Hac Vice (HEREBY ORDERED by Magistrate Judge Gabriel W. Gorenstein)(Text Only Order) (Gorenstein, Gabriel) (Entered: 10/31/2013) |
| 10/31/2013 | | Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr: Telephone Status Conference held on 10/31/2013. Drew Hansen and Jordan Connors. Ryan Decker and Holly House for Defendants Twin City America, City Sights, City Sights Twin. Andrew Lazerow for Defendant Coach and International Bus Services. The joint proposed redactions are approved. Court Reporter: Chris Sellin. (tdh) (Entered: 11/01/2013) |
| 11/01/2013 | 68 | ORDER granting 64 Motion to Seal. IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, upon good cause shown, Plaintiff's Motion to File Under Seal is GRANTED. Plaintiffs shall file the following documents and portions of documents under seal: Exhibits 4,15,16,18,26,27,35,39,41,45,48,49,57,61 to the Declaration of Jordan Connors in Support of Plaintiff's Motion for Class Certification; Portions of the Declaration of Hal J. Singer, PHD that refer to material that defendants have designated Confidential or Highly Confidential; Portions of the Declaration of Alan Vasquez Re Dissemination of Notice to Class Members and Claims Administration that refer to material that defendants have designated Confidential or Highly Confidential; Portions of Plaintiff's Motion for Class Certification that refer to material that defendants have designated Confidential or Highly Confidential. Portions of Exhibit 13 to the Declaration of Jordan Connors in Support of Plaintiffs Motion for Class Certification that refer to material that Defendants have designated Confidential or Highly Confidential. (Signed by Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr on 11/1/2013) (js) Modified on 11/1/2013 (js). |

| | | |
|------------|--------------------|---|
| | | (Entered: 11/01/2013) |
| 11/01/2013 | | Transmission to Sealed Records Clerk. Transmitted re: 68 Order on Motion to Seal,,,,, to the Sealed Records Clerk for the sealing or unsealing of document or case. (js) (Entered: 11/01/2013) |
| 11/01/2013 | 69 | STIPULATED AGREEMENT AND ORDER REGARDING PRESERVATION OF PRIVILEGE CLAIMS regarding procedures to be followed that shall govern the handling of confidential material. (Signed by Magistrate Judge Gabriel W. Gorenstein on 11/1/2013) (rsh) (Entered: 11/01/2013) |
| 11/04/2013 | 70 | MOTION to Certify Class. Document filed by Natasha Bhandari, Tracey L. Nobel.Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(Hansen, Drew) (Entered: 11/04/2013) |
| 11/04/2013 | 71 | MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: (39 in 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 70 in 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 31 in 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG, 54 in 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 44 in 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG) MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Tracey L. Nobel, Natasha Bhandari. Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(Hansen, Drew) (Entered: 11/04/2013) |
| 11/04/2013 | 72 | DECLARATION of Tracey Nobel in Support re: (39 in 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 70 in 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 31 in 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG, 54 in 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 44 in 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG) MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Tracey L. Nobel, Natasha Bhandari. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit A)Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(Hansen, Drew) (Entered: 11/04/2013) |
| 11/04/2013 | 73 | DECLARATION of Natasha Bhandari in Support re: (39 in 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 70 in 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 31 in 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG, 54 in 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 44 in 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG) MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Tracey L. Nobel, Natasha Bhandari. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit A)Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(Hansen, Drew) (Entered: 11/04/2013) |
| 11/04/2013 | 74 | DECLARATION of Hal Singer in Support re: (39 in 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 70 in 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 31 in 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG, 54 in 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 44 in 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG) MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Tracey L. Nobel, Natasha Bhandari. (Attachments: # 1 Appendix 1, # 2 Appendix 2, # 3 Appendix 3)Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(Hansen, Drew) (Entered: 11/04/2013) |
| 11/04/2013 | 75 | DECLARATION of Alan Vasquez in Support re: (39 in 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 70 in 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 31 in 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG, 54 in 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 44 in 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG) MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Tracey L. Nobel, Natasha Bhandari. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit |

| | | |
|------------|--------------------|--|
| | | 1)Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(Hansen, Drew) (Entered: 11/04/2013) |
| 11/04/2013 | 76 | DECLARATION of William Christopher Carmody in Support re: (70 in 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 39 in 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 31 in 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG, 54 in 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 44 in 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG) MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Tracey L. Nobel, Natasha Bhandari. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit A, # 2 Exhibit B, # 3 Exhibit C, # 4 Exhibit D, # 5 Exhibit E, # 6 Exhibit F)Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(Hansen, Drew) (Entered: 11/04/2013) |
| 11/04/2013 | 77 | DECLARATION of Jordan Connors in Support re: (31 in 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG, 54 in 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 44 in 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 70 in 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 39 in 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG) MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Tracey L. Nobel, Natasha Bhandari. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit 1, # 2 Exhibit 2, # 3 Exhibit 3, # 4 Exhibit 4, # 5 Exhibit 5, # 6 Exhibit 6, # 7 Exhibit 7, # 8 Exhibit 8, # 9 Exhibit 9, # 10 Exhibit 10, # 11 Exhibit 11, # 12 Exhibit 12, # 13 Exhibit 13, # 14 Exhibit 14, # 15 Exhibit 15, # 16 Exhibit 16, # 17 Exhibit 17, # 18 Exhibit 18, # 19 Exhibit 19, # 20 Exhibit 20, # 21 Exhibit 21, # 22 Exhibit 22, # 23 Exhibit 23, # 24 Exhibit 24, # 25 Exhibit 25, # 26 Exhibit 26, # 27 Exhibit 27-35, # 28 Exhibit 36, # 29 Exhibit 37, # 30 Exhibit 38, # 31 Exhibit 39, # 32 Exhibit 40, # 33 Exhibit 41, # 34 Exhibit 42, # 35 Exhibit 43, # 36 Exhibit 44, # 37 Exhibit 45, # 38 Exhibit 46, # 39 Exhibit 47, # 40 Exhibit 48, # 41 Exhibit 49, # 42 Exhibit 50, # 43 Exhibit 51, # 44 Errata 52, # 45 Exhibit 53, # 46 Exhibit 54, # 47 Exhibit 55, # 48 Exhibit 56, # 49 Exhibit 57-61, # 50 Exhibit 62)Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(Hansen, Drew) (Entered: 11/04/2013) |
| 11/06/2013 | 78 | CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE of Notice of Motion for Class Certification and Supporting Papers (Docket Nos. 70 to 77). Document filed by Natasha Bhandari. (Hatch-Miller, Mark) (Entered: 11/06/2013) |
| 11/13/2013 | 79 | AMENDED SCHEDULING ORDER: Defendants shall serve an unredacted version of their class certification response brief and any expert report on Plaintiffs, produce to Plaintiffs any native or backup documents underlying any expert report, and email an unredacted version of the brief and any expert report to the Court by 5:00 pm on December 16, 2013, and as further set forth in this document. Fact Discovery due by 2/28/2014. Expert Discovery due by 5/26/2014. (Signed by Magistrate Judge Gabriel W. Gorenstein on 11/13/2013) (cd) Modified on 11/15/2013 (cd). (Entered: 11/13/2013) |
| 11/13/2013 | 80 | MOTION for Leave to File First Amended Consolidated Class Action Complaint , <i>Unopposed By Defendants</i> . Document filed by Natasha Bhandari. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit [Proposed] First Amended Consolidated Class Action Complaint, # 2 Text of Proposed Order [Proposed] Order Granting Unopposed Motion for Leave to Amend Consolidated Class Action Complaint)Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175- |

| | | |
|------------|--------------------|--|
| | | ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(Hatch-Miller, Mark) (Entered: 11/13/2013) |
| 11/14/2013 | 81 | ORDER in case 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG; granting (80) Motion for Leave to File Document in case 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG (HEREBY ORDERED by Magistrate Judge Gabriel W. Gorenstein)(Text Only Order) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG (Gorenstein, Gabriel) (Entered: 11/14/2013) |
| 11/14/2013 | 83 | FIRST AMENDED CONSOLIDATED CLASS ACTION COMPLAINT amending 40 Amended Complaint, against City Sights L.L.C., City Sights Twin, LLC, Coach USA, Inc., International Bus Services, Inc., Twin America, L.L.C. with JURY DEMAND.Document filed by Tracey L. Nobel, Natasha Bhandari. Related document: 40 Amended Complaint, filed by Natasha Bhandari.(mro) (Entered: 11/18/2013) |
| 11/15/2013 | 82 | SEALED DOCUMENT placed in vault.(mps) (Entered: 11/15/2013) |
| 11/18/2013 | 84 | NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Seth D. Ard on behalf of Natasha Bhandari, Tracey L. Nobel. (Ard, Seth) (Entered: 11/18/2013) |
| 12/02/2013 | 85 | AMENDED SCHEDULING ORDER: Defendants shall serve an unredacted version of their class certification response brief and any expert report on Plaintiffs, produce to Plaintiffs any native or backup documents underlying any expert report. and email an unredacted version of the brief and any expert report to the Court by 5:00 pm on January 10, 2014. Defendants' opposition brief may be up to thirty (30) pages. The Parties shall confer on proposed redactions to Defendants' brief and any expert report and submit proposed redactions to the Court by January 14, 2014, along with a motion to seal. Plaintiffs shall serve an unredacted version of their class certification reply brief on Defendants and email an unredacted version of the brief to the Court on February 21, 2014. Plaintiffs' reply brief may be up to fifteen (15) pages. The Parties shall confer on proposed redactions to Plaintiffs' reply brief and submit proposed redactions to the Court by February 26, 2014, along with a motion to seal. Plaintiffs may seek leave from the Court to serve an expert report with its reply brief. Defendants reserve their right to oppose any such application. All fact discovery shall be completed by February 28, 2014. Plaintiffs shall disclose the identities of any other expert witnesses and serve such experts' written reports on March 28, 2014. Defendants shall disclose the identities of any other expert witnesses and serve such experts' written reports on April 28, 2014. The deadline for deposing Plaintiffs' and Defendants' expert witnesses shall be May 26, 2014. It is further provided that Defendants shall have the right to take the deposition(s) of any Plaintiffs' expert(s) at least 7 days prior to the deposition(s) of Defendants' expert(s). The deadline for Defendants to submit a letter to Judge Carter requesting a pre-motion conference regarding a contemplated summary judgment motion shall be June 16, 2014. Fact Discovery due by 2/28/2014. Expert Discovery due by 5/26/2014. (Signed by Magistrate Judge Gabriel W. Gorenstein on 12/2/2013) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(rsh) (Entered: 12/02/2013) |
| 12/02/2013 | 86 | ANSWER to 83 Amended Complaint,. Document filed by City Sights L.L.C., City Sights Twin, LLC, Twin America, L.L.C..(House, Holly) (Entered: 12/02/2013) |

| | | |
|------------|--------------------|--|
| 12/02/2013 | 87 | ANSWER to 83 Amended Complaint,. Document filed by Coach USA, Inc., International Bus Services, Inc..(Lazerow, Andrew) (Entered: 12/02/2013) |
| 12/04/2013 | 88 | ORDER SCHEDULING SETTLEMENT CONFERENCE: Settlement Conference set for 12/12/2013 at 10:00 AM in Courtroom 6B, 500 Pearl Street, New York, NY 10007 before Magistrate Judge Gabriel W. Gorenstein, and as further set forth in this document. (Signed by Magistrate Judge Gabriel W. Gorenstein on 12/4/2013) (cd) (Entered: 12/04/2013) |
| 01/14/2014 | 89 | MOTION to Seal <i>Redacted Portions of Defendants' Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification</i> . Document filed by City Sights Twin, L.L.C., Citysights L.L.C., Coach USA, Inc., International Bus Services, Inc., Twin America, L.L.C., City Sights Twin, LLC, CitySights, LLC, Coach USA, Inc., Twin America, LLC, International Bus Services Inc., City Sights, LLC, City Sights L.L.C..Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(Barnett, Thomas) (Entered: 01/14/2014) |
| 01/14/2014 | 90 | DECLARATION of Ashley Bass in Support re: (55 in 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 50 in 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 65 in 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 89 in 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 42 in 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG) MOTION to Seal <i>Redacted Portions of Defendants' Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification</i> .. Document filed by Coach USA, Inc., International Bus Services, Inc., Coach USA, Inc., International Bus Services Inc.. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit A, # 2 Exhibit B, # 3 Exhibit C)Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(Bass, Ashley) (Entered: 01/14/2014) |
| 01/21/2014 | 91 | NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Megan O'Hara Easley on behalf of Natasha Bhandari, Tracey L. Nobel. (Easley, Megan) (Entered: 01/21/2014) |
| 01/27/2014 | 92 | AMENDED MOTION to Seal <i>Redacted Portions of Defendants' Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification</i> . Document filed by City Sights Twin, L.L.C., Citysights L.L.C., Coach USA, Inc., International Bus Services, Inc., Twin America, L.L.C., City Sights Twin, LLC, CitySights, LLC, Coach USA, Inc., Twin America, LLC, International Bus Services Inc., City Sights, LLC, City Sights L.L.C..Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(Barnett, Thomas) (Entered: 01/27/2014) |
| 01/27/2014 | 93 | DECLARATION of Ashley Bass in Support re: (44 in 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG) AMENDED MOTION to Seal <i>Redacted Portions of Defendants' Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification</i> .. Document filed by City Sights Twin, L.L.C., Citysights L.L.C., Coach USA, Inc., International Bus Services, Inc., Twin America, L.L.C., City Sights Twin, LLC, CitySights, LLC, Coach USA, Inc., Twin America, LLC, International Bus Services Inc., City Sights, LLC, City Sights L.L.C.. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit A, # 2 Exhibit B, # 3 Exhibit C, # 4 Exhibit D)Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(Barnett, Thomas) (Entered: 01/27/2014) |

| | | |
|------------|--------------------|--|
| 01/27/2014 | 94 | LETTER addressed to Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. from Thomas O. Barnett dated January 27, 2014 re: Amended Motion to Seal Redacted Portions of Defendants' Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification. Document filed by Coach USA, Inc., International Bus Services, Inc., Coach USA, Inc., International Bus Services Inc..Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(Barnett, Thomas) (Entered: 01/27/2014) |
| 02/04/2014 | 95 | AMENDED SCHEDULING ORDER: Motion to seal due by 2/26/2014. Fact Discovery, except contention interrogatories and requests for admissions, due by 4/28/2014. Deposition of expert witnesses due by 7/28/2014. The deadline for Defendants to submit a letter to Judge Carter requesting a pre-motion conference regarding a contemplated summary judgment motion shall be August 25, 2014. (Signed by Magistrate Judge Gabriel W. Gorenstein on 2/4/2014) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(tn) (Entered: 02/04/2014) |
| 02/26/2014 | 96 | MOTION to Seal <i>Pltfs' Reply Memo IFSO Class Cert and Supporting Documents</i> . Document filed by Natasha Bhandari, Tracey L. Nobel. (Attachments: # 1 Text of Proposed Order)Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(Hatch-Miller, Mark) (Entered: 02/26/2014) |
| 02/26/2014 | 97 | REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: (48 in 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG, 61 in 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 71 in 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 56 in 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 96 in 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG) MOTION to Seal <i>Pltfs' Reply Memo IFSO Class Cert and Supporting Documents.</i> , (39 in 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 70 in 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 31 in 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG, 54 in 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 44 in 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG) MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Natasha Bhandari, Tracey L. Nobel. Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(Hatch-Miller, Mark) (Entered: 02/26/2014) |
| 02/26/2014 | 98 | DECLARATION of Arun Subramanian in Support re: (48 in 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG, 56 in 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 96 in 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 61 in 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 71 in 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG) MOTION to Seal <i>Pltfs' Reply Memo IFSO Class Cert and Supporting Documents.</i> , (70 in 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 39 in 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 31 in 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG, 54 in 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 44 in 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG) MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Natasha Bhandari, Tracey L. Nobel. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit 1, # 2 Exhibit 2, # 3 Exhibit 3, # 4 Exhibit 4, # 5 Exhibit 5, # 6 Exhibit 6, # 7 Exhibit 7, # 8 Exhibit 8, # 9 Exhibit 9, # 10 Exhibit 10, # 11 Exhibit 11, # 12 Exhibit 12, # 13 Exhibit 13)Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(Hatch-Miller, Mark) (Entered: 02/26/2014) |

| | | |
|------------|---------------------|--|
| 02/26/2014 | 99 | LETTER addressed to Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. from William Christopher Carmody dated February 26, 2014 re: alerting court to recent authority. Document filed by Natasha Bhandari. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit A)Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(Ard, Seth) (Entered: 02/26/2014) |
| 03/04/2014 | 100 | LETTER addressed to Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. from Thomas O. Barnett dated March 4, 2014 re: Response to Plaintiff's Letter of February 26, 2014. Document filed by Coach USA, Inc., International Bus Services, Inc., Coach USA, Inc., International Bus Services Inc.. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit Supplemental Authority, # 2 Exhibit Supplemental Authority)Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(Barnett, Thomas) (Entered: 03/04/2014) |
| 03/18/2014 | 101 | ORDER: The parties should submit a joint status report by May 2, 2014. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr on 3/18/2014) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(ama) (Entered: 03/18/2014) |
| 05/20/2014 | 102 | MOTION for Settlement . Document filed by Natasha Bhandari. (Attachments: # 1 Text of Proposed Order)(Carmody, William) (Entered: 05/20/2014) |
| 05/20/2014 | 103 | MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: 102 MOTION for Settlement . . Document filed by Natasha Bhandari. (Carmody, William) (Entered: 05/20/2014) |
| 05/20/2014 | 104 | DECLARATION of William C. Carmody in Support re: 102 MOTION for Settlement .. Document filed by Natasha Bhandari. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit 1)(Carmody, William) (Entered: 05/20/2014) |
| 05/20/2014 | 105 | DECLARATION of Shannon R. Wheatman in Support re: 102 MOTION for Settlement .. Document filed by Natasha Bhandari. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit 1, # 2 Exhibit 2, # 3 Exhibit 3, # 4 Exhibit 4, # 5 Exhibit 5, # 6 Exhibit 6)(Carmody, William) (Entered: 05/20/2014) |
| 05/20/2014 | 106 | DECLARATION of Antonio Piazza in Support re: 102 MOTION for Settlement .. Document filed by Natasha Bhandari. (Carmody, William) (Entered: 05/20/2014) |
| 06/16/2014 | 107 | ORDER PRELIMINARILY APPROVING CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT in case 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG; deferring ruling on (44) Motion to Certify Class in case 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG; deferring ruling on (39) Motion to Certify Class in case 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG; granting (102) Motion for Settlement in case 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG; deferring ruling on (31) Motion to Certify Class in case 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG. NOW, THEREFORE, pursuant to the Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 23, it is hereby ORDERED that: The capitalized terms used herein shall have the meanings set forth in the Agreement. The Court preliminarily approves the Settlement as set forth in the Agreement, including the releases contained therein, as being fair, reasonable and adequate to the Class, subject to the right of any Class Member to challenge the fairness, reasonableness or adequacy of the Agreement and to show cause, if any exists, why a final judgment dismissing the Action against |

| | | |
|------------|---------------------|---|
| | | <p>Defendants, and ordering the release of the Released Claims against Releasees, should not be entered after due and adequate notice to the Class as set forth in the Agreement and after a hearing on final approval. The Court hereby appoints Class Plaintiffs' Counsel as counsel to the Class for purposes of the Settlement, having determined that the requirements of Rule 23(g) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure are fully satisfied by this appointment. Class Plaintiffs Natasha Bhandari and Tracey L. Nobel will serve as representatives of the Class for purposes of the Settlement. The Court appoints Rust Consulting, a competent firm, as the Claims Administrator. The Claims Administrator shall be responsible for receiving requests for exclusion from the Class Members. As of the date hereof, all proceedings in the action as to Defendants shall be stayed and suspended until further order of the Court, except as may be necessary to implement the Settlement or comply with the terms of the Agreement. Any member of the Settlement Class may request to be excluded from the Class. To be effective, written notice must be postmarked as set forth in the Notice (by September 5, 2014), which is 45 days prior to the final fairness hearing, and must otherwise comply with the requirements set forth in the Notice. Any member of the Settlement Class who does not timely seek exclusion from the Class and who wishes to object to the terms of the relevant Proposed Settlement must do so in writing, must mail or deliver copies of such objection to Counsel for the Settling Parties and the Clerk of the Court (by September 5, 2014), which is 45 days prior to the final fairness hearing ("objection deadline"), and must otherwise comply with the requirements set forth in the Notice. The Court hereby schedules a hearing to occur on October 20th 2014, at 10:00 a.m. before the Honorable Andrew L. Carter Jr. in United States District Court for the Southern District of New York, Thurgood Marshall United States Courthouse, 40 Foley Square New York, NY 10007 to determine whether (i) the proposed Settlement as set forth in the Agreement, should be finally approved as fair, reasonable and adequate pursuant to the Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 23; (ii) an order approving the Agreement and a Final Judgment should be entered; (iii) an order approving a proposed distribution plan should be approved; and (iv) the application of Class Plaintiffs' Counsel for an award of attorneys' fees, incentive awards, and expenses ("Fee Request") in this matter should be approved. All papers in support of any Fee Request, all papers in support of the proposed distribution plan, and all papers in support of final approval of the Settlement, shall be filed no later than (20) days before the objection deadline. No later than seven (7) days before the final fairness hearing, all relevant reply papers shall be filed and served by the parties to the action. And as set forth herein. (Signed by Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr on 6/16/2014) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG (ama) Modified on 6/16/2014 (ama). (Entered: 06/16/2014)</p> |
| 06/16/2014 | | <p>Set/Reset Hearings: Final Fairness Hearing set for 10/20/2014 at 10:00 AM before Judge Andrew L. Carter Jr. Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(ama) (Entered: 06/16/2014)</p> |
| 06/17/2014 | 108 | <p>MOTION to Set November 19, 2014 as Claims Deadline . Document filed by Natasha Bhandari. (Attachments: # 1 Text of Proposed Order)(Carmody, William) (Entered: 06/17/2014)</p> |

| | | |
|------------|---------------------|--|
| 06/18/2014 | 109 | ORDER SETTING CLAIMS DEADLINE: NOW, THEREFORE, pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 23, it is hereby ORDERED that January 19, 2015, is the Claims Deadline in this action. Motions terminated: (108 in 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG) MOTION to Set November 19, 2014 as Claims Deadline filed by Natasha Bhandari. (Signed by Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr on 6/18/2014) (ama) (Entered: 06/19/2014) |
| 08/15/2014 | 110 | MOTION for Settlement <i>for Final Approval of Settlement with Defendants</i> . Document filed by Natasha Bhandari, Tracey L. Nobel. (Attachments: # 1 Text of Proposed Order, # 2 Exhibit 1)(Carmody, William) (Entered: 08/15/2014) |
| 08/15/2014 | 111 | MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: 110 MOTION for Settlement <i>for Final Approval of Settlement with Defendants</i> . . Document filed by Natasha Bhandari, Tracey L. Nobel. (Carmody, William) (Entered: 08/15/2014) |
| 08/15/2014 | 112 | DECLARATION of William Christopher Carmody in Support re: 110 MOTION for Settlement <i>for Final Approval of Settlement with Defendants</i> .. Document filed by Natasha Bhandari, Tracey L. Nobel. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit 1)(Carmody, William) (Entered: 08/15/2014) |
| 08/15/2014 | 113 | DECLARATION of Shannon R. Wheatman, Ph.D. in Support re: 110 MOTION for Settlement <i>for Final Approval of Settlement with Defendants</i> .. Document filed by Natasha Bhandari, Tracey L. Nobel. (Attachments: # 1 Part 2 of Declaration) (Carmody, William) (Entered: 08/15/2014) |
| 08/15/2014 | 114 | DECLARATION of Daniel Coggeshall in Support re: 110 MOTION for Settlement <i>for Final Approval of Settlement with Defendants</i> .. Document filed by Natasha Bhandari, Tracey L. Nobel. (Carmody, William) (Entered: 08/15/2014) |
| 08/15/2014 | 115 | MOTION for Attorney Fees . Document filed by Natasha Bhandari, Tracey L. Nobel. (Carmody, William) (Entered: 08/15/2014) |
| 08/15/2014 | 116 | MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: 115 MOTION for Attorney Fees . . Document filed by Natasha Bhandari, Tracey L. Nobel. (Carmody, William) (Entered: 08/16/2014) |
| 08/16/2014 | 117 | DECLARATION of William Christopher Carmody in Support re: 115 MOTION for Attorney Fees .. Document filed by Tracey L. Nobel. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit 1)(Carmody, William) (Entered: 08/16/2014) |
| 08/19/2014 | | ***DELETED DOCUMENT. Deleted document number 118 Order. The document was incorrectly filed in this case. (ajs) (Entered: 08/20/2014) |
| 08/20/2014 | 118 | ORDER finding as moot (54) Motion to Certify Class; finding as moot (65) Motion to Seal; finding as moot (67) Motion to Seal; finding as moot (71) Motion to Seal in case 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG; finding as moot (44) Motion to Certify Class; finding as moot (55) Motion to Seal; finding as moot (57) Motion to Seal; finding as moot (61) Motion to Seal in case 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG; finding as moot (39) Motion to Certify Class; finding as moot (50) Motion to Seal; finding as moot (52) Motion to Seal; finding as moot (56) Motion to Seal in case 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG; finding as moot (70) Motion to Certify Class; finding as moot (89) Motion to Seal; finding as |

| | | |
|------------|---------------------|---|
| | | moot (92) Motion to Seal; finding as moot (96) Motion to Seal in case 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG; finding as moot (31) Motion to Certify Class; finding as moot (42) Motion to Seal; finding as moot (44) Motion to Seal; finding as moot (48) Motion to Seal in case 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG. In light of the parties' recent Motion for Settlement (ECF No. 110), the following motions are DENIED as moot: (1) Motion to Certify Class (ECF No. 70); (2) Motion to Seal Redacted Portions of Defendants' Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification (ECF No. 89); (3) Amended Motion to Seal Redacted Portions of Defendants' Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification (ECF No. 92); (4) Motion to Seal Pltfs' Reply Memo IFSO Class Cert and Supporting Documents (ECF No. 96). SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr on 8/19/2014) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG (ajs) (Entered: 08/20/2014) |
| 08/26/2014 | 119 | LETTER addressed to Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. from Megan O'Hara Easley dated 8/26/2014 re: Compliance with paragraph 15 of the Order Preliminarily Approving Class Action Settlement. Document filed by Natasha Bhandari, Tracey L. Nobel. (Easley, Megan) (Entered: 08/26/2014) |
| 10/13/2014 | 120 | LETTER addressed to Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. from William Christopher Carmody dated 10/13/2014 re: status update in advance of the final approval hearing. Document filed by Natasha Bhandari, Tracey L. Nobel. (Attachments: # 1 Affidavit of Milan Mader, # 2 Text of Proposed Order Final Judgment Approving Settlement, # 3 Text of Proposed Order Awarding Fees and Expenses)(Carmody, William) (Entered: 10/13/2014) |
| 10/20/2014 | 121 | LETTER addressed to Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. from Thomas O. Barnett dated October 20, 2014 re: Notification Pursuant to Rule 1.12 of the New York Rules of Professional Conduct. Document filed by Coach USA, Inc., International Bus Services, Inc.(Barnett, Thomas) (Entered: 10/20/2014) |
| 10/20/2014 | | Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr: Fairness Hearing held on 10/20/2014. Drew Hansen, Arun Subramanian, William Carmody and Seth Ard for Plaintiff(s). Tracey Nobel, Class Representative present. Andrew D. Lazerow for Defendants Coach and International Bus. Holly House for Defendants Twin City, City Sights, City Sights Twins and NYC Bus Care. See Docket Nos. 122 and 123 for complete details. Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG (tdh) (Entered: 10/23/2014) |
| 10/21/2014 | 122 | ORDER AND FINAL JUDGMENT APPROVING IN RE NYC BUS TOUR ANTITRUST LITIGATION CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT: NOW, THEREFORE, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED: The capitalized terms used herein shall have the meanings set forth in the Settlement, Exhibit 1 to the Declaration of William Christopher Carmody in Support of Preliminary Approval of Settlement (Docket# 104) ("Settlement Agreement"). The Preliminary Approval Order outlined the form and manner by which the Class Plaintiffs would provide the Class with notice of the Settlement, the fairness hearing, and related matters. Proof that mailing and publication complied with the Preliminary Approval Order has been filed |

| | | |
|------------|---------------------|--|
| | | <p>with the Court. This Notice given to Class Members complied in all respects with the requirements of Rule 23 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure and due process, and provided due and adequate notice to the Class. The Court approves, as to form and content, the Class Action Fairness Act ("CAFA") Notice that was served within 10 days after the filing of the Motion for Preliminary Approval of the Settlement (an example of the Notice is attached as Exhibit 1). The Court finds that the Attorney General of the United States and the state attorneys general have received notice of the Settlement Agreement in accordance with the terms of CAFA, 28 U.S.C. § 1715(b). And as set forth herein. (Signed by Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr on 10/21/2014) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(ama) (Entered: 10/21/2014)</p> |
| 10/21/2014 | 123 | <p>ORDER AND JUDGMENT AWARDING FEES AND EXPENSES: NOW, THEREFORE, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED: The capitalized terms used herein shall have the meanings set forth in the Agreement. Class Plaintiffs' Counsel shall receive \$6,270,000 in attorneys' fees, representing a third of the fund recovered, to be paid out of the Gross Settlement Fund created by the Settlement. Plaintiffs' Counsel shall be reimbursed \$863,629.46 in costs and expenses reasonably incurred in the presentation and settlement of this litigation, to be paid out of the Gross Settlement Fund created by the Settlement. The Notice and Administrative Costs incurred to date are \$1,069,158.54. Under the terms of the Settlement, those costs are payable as they become due out of the Gross Settlement Fund to those that incurred the costs. Notice and Administrative Costs, Taxes and Tax Expenses, Escrow Agent Costs, other expenses, and future expenses of Class Counsel, may be paid out of the Gross Settlement Fund as permitted in the Settlement, including, 15-16 thereof. A service award of \$20,000, to be paid out of the Gross Settlement Fund created by the Settlement, shall be paid to each of the Class Plaintiffs. This Order and Judgment shall become effective immediately. (Signed by Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr on 10/21/2014) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(ama) (Entered: 10/21/2014)</p> |
| 10/29/2014 | 124 | <p>TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: HEARING held on 10/20/2014 before Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Vincent Bologna, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 11/24/2014. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 12/4/2014. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 1/30/2015. Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 10/29/2014)</p> |
| 10/29/2014 | 125 | <p>NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a HEARING proceeding held on 10/20/2014 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely</p> |

| | | |
|------------|---------------------|---|
| | | electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 10/29/2014) |
| 11/20/2014 | 126 | FILING ERROR - DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY - MOTION to Approve Claims Stimulation Plan . Document filed by Natasha Bhandari. (Attachments: # 1 Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion for Approval of Claims Stimulation Plan, # 2 Text of Proposed Order for Approval of Claims Stimulation Plan)(Easley, Megan) Modified on 11/21/2014 (db). (Entered: 11/20/2014) |
| 11/20/2014 | 127 | FILING ERROR - DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY - DECLARATION of Shannon R. Wheatman, in Support re: 126 MOTION to Approve Claims Stimulation Plan .. Document filed by Natasha Bhandari. (Easley, Megan) Modified on 11/21/2014 (db). (Entered: 11/20/2014) |
| 11/21/2014 | | ***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE-FILE DOCUMENT - DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY ERROR. Note to Attorney Megan O'Hara Easley to RE-FILE Document 126 MOTION to Approve Claims Stimulation Plan . ERROR(S): Supporting Documents are filed separately, each receiving their own document #. (db) (Entered: 11/21/2014) |
| 11/21/2014 | | ***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE-FILE DOCUMENT - DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY ERROR. Note to Attorney Megan O'Hara Easley to RE-FILE Document 127 Declaration in Support of Motion. ERROR(S): Document linked to filing error. (db) (Entered: 11/21/2014) |
| 11/21/2014 | 128 | MOTION to Approve Claims Stimulation Plan . Document filed by Natasha Bhandari. (Attachments: # 1 Text of Proposed Order for Approval of Claims Stimulation Plan)(Easley, Megan) (Entered: 11/21/2014) |
| 11/21/2014 | 129 | MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: 128 MOTION to Approve Claims Stimulation Plan . . Document filed by Natasha Bhandari. (Easley, Megan) (Entered: 11/21/2014) |
| 11/21/2014 | 130 | DECLARATION of Shannon R. Wheatman in Support re: 128 MOTION to Approve Claims Stimulation Plan .. Document filed by Natasha Bhandari. (Easley, Megan) (Entered: 11/21/2014) |
| 12/01/2014 | 131 | ORDER APPROVING CLAIMS STIMULATION PLAN granting (128) Motion to Approve in case 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG. NOW, THEREFORE, pursuant to the Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 23, it is hereby ORDERED that: 1. Plaintiffs are authorized to implement the Claims Stimulation Plan and take such other action as appropriate for the purpose of providing supplemental notice to the class in this action in advance of the claims deadline of January 19, 2015. (Signed by Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr on 12/1/2014) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG (lmb) (Entered: 12/02/2014) |
| 12/12/2014 | 132 | NOTICE OF CHANGE OF ADDRESS by Thomas O. Barnett on behalf of Coach USA, Inc., International Bus Services, Inc.. New Address: Covington & Burling LLP, |

| | | |
|------------|---------------------|--|
| | | 850 10th St., NW, Washington, DC, U.S.A. 20001, 202-662-6000. Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(Barnett, Thomas) (Entered: 12/12/2014) |
| 12/12/2014 | 133 | NOTICE OF CHANGE OF ADDRESS by Ashley E. Bass on behalf of Coach USA, Inc., International Bus Services, Inc.. New Address: Covington & Burling LLP, 850 10th St., NW, Washington, DC, U.S.A. 20001, 202-662-6000. Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(Bass, Ashley) (Entered: 12/12/2014) |
| 12/12/2014 | 134 | NOTICE OF CHANGE OF ADDRESS by Andrew D. Lazerow on behalf of Coach USA, Inc., International Bus Services, Inc.. New Address: Covington & Burling LLP, 850 10th St., NW, Washington, DC, U.S.A. 20001, 202-662-6000. Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(Lazerow, Andrew) (Entered: 12/12/2014) |
| 12/12/2014 | 135 | NOTICE OF CHANGE OF ADDRESS by Alan M. Wiseman on behalf of Coach USA, Inc., International Bus Services, Inc.. New Address: Covington & Burling LLP, 850 10th St., NW, Washington, DC, U.S.A. 20001, 202-662-6000. Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(Wiseman, Alan) (Entered: 12/12/2014) |
| 07/23/2015 | 136 | MOTION to Approve of Distribution . Document filed by Mary Hanson, Tracey L. Nobel, Natasha Bhandari. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit 1)Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(Easley, Megan) (Entered: 07/23/2015) |
| 07/23/2015 | 137 | MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: (66 in 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG, 89 in 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 136 in 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 79 in 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 74 in 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG) MOTION to Approve of Distribution . . Document filed by Mary Hanson, Tracey L. Nobel, Natasha Bhandari. Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(Easley, Megan) (Entered: 07/23/2015) |
| 07/23/2015 | 138 | DECLARATION of Amy Lake in Support re: (66 in 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG, 89 in 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 136 in 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 79 in 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 74 in 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG) MOTION to Approve of Distribution .. Document filed by Mary Hanson, Tracey L. Nobel, Natasha Bhandari. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit A)Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(Easley, Megan) (Entered: 07/23/2015) |
| 09/21/2015 | 139 | ORDER APPROVING DISTRIBUTION in case 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG; granting (136) Motion to Approve Distribution in case 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG. It is hereby |

| | | |
|------------|---------------------|---|
| | | <p>ORDERED that: 1. The Court qualifies the 184 Class Members who submitted or requested permission to submit claims for 647 tickets after the Claims Deadline but before January 31, 2015 as Authorized Claimants. 2. The Court approves the Distribution allocating \$20 per qualifying class member ticket purchase, and the Court approves distributing \$4,846,660 from the Net Settlement Fund to Authorized Claimants. 3. In the event that there is any balance remaining in the Net Settlement Fund, Plaintiffs are authorized to distribute the residual funds to the Government Entities as specified in Paragraph 19 of the Settlement. 4. Plaintiffs are authorized to pay from the Gross Settlement Fund costs and expenses incurred and expected to be incurred by the Claims Administrator in assisting Class Members with filing and processing claims and distributing the Net Settlement Fund. 5. Plaintiffs are authorized to pay from the Gross Settlement Fund Class Plaintiffs' Counsel's costs and expenses of \$3,671.89 incurred in connection with the October 20, 2014 fairness hearing. 6. Class Members are barred from making any further claims against the Net Settlement Fund (regardless of whether or not they receive payment from the Net Settlement Fund), and all persons, including the Claims Administrator, Plaintiffs and Class Plaintiffs' Counsel, involved in the processing of the claims discussed herein are released and discharged from from any claims arising out of such involvement. (As further set forth in this Order.) (Signed by Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr on 9/21/2015) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG (kgo) (Entered: 09/21/2015)</p> |
| 12/22/2015 | 140 | <p>NOTICE OF CHANGE OF ADDRESS by Seth D. Ard on behalf of Natasha Bhandari. New Address: Susman Godfrey L.L.P., 560 Lexington Avenue, 15th Floor, New York, NY, 10022, (212) 336-8330. (Ard, Seth) (Entered: 12/22/2015)</p> |
| 06/07/2016 | 141 | <p>NOTICE OF CHANGE OF ADDRESS by Arun Srinivas Subramanian on behalf of Natasha Bhandari, Tracey L. Nobel. New Address: Susman Godfrey L.L.P., 1301 Avenue of the Americas, 32nd Fl., New York, NY, USA 10019, 212-336-8330. Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(Subramanian, Arun) (Entered: 06/07/2016)</p> |
| 06/07/2016 | 142 | <p>NOTICE OF CHANGE OF ADDRESS by William Christopher Carmody on behalf of Natasha Bhandari, Tracey L. Nobel. New Address: Susman Godfrey L.L.P., 1301 Avenue of the Americas, 32nd Fl., New York, NY, USA 10019, 2123368330. Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(Carmody, William) (Entered: 06/07/2016)</p> |
| 06/07/2016 | 143 | <p>NOTICE OF CHANGE OF ADDRESS by Mark Howard Hatch-Miller on behalf of Natasha Bhandari, Tracey L. Nobel. New Address: Susman Godfrey L.L.P., 1301 Avenue of the Americas, 32nd Fl., New York, NY, USA 10019, 2123368330. Filed In Associated Cases: 1:13-cv-00711-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09066-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09128-ALC-GWG, 1:12-cv-09175-ALC-GWG, 1:13-cv-01973-ALC-GWG(Hatch-Miller, Mark) (Entered: 06/07/2016)</p> |

| | | |
|------------|---------------------|---|
| 06/10/2016 | 144 | NOTICE OF CHANGE OF ADDRESS by Seth D. Ard on behalf of Natasha Bhandari, Tracey L. Nobel. New Address: Susman Godfrey, L.L.C., 1301 Avenue of The Americas, 32nd Floor, New York, NY, 10019, (212) 336-8330. (Ard, Seth) (Entered: 06/10/2016) |
| 08/02/2016 | | Terminate Transcript Deadlines (mro) (Entered: 08/03/2016) |
