

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK**

THOMAS LAUMANN, ROBERT SILVER,
GARRETT TRAUB, and DAVID DILLON,
representing themselves and all other similarly
situated,

Plaintiffs,

v.

NATIONAL HOCKEY LEAGUE, et al.

Defendants.

12-cv-1817 (SAS)

ECF Case

Electronically Filed

FERNANDA GARBER, MARC LERNER,
DEREK RASMUSSEN, ROBERT SILVER,
GARRETT TRAUB, and PETER HERMAN,
representing themselves and all other similarly
situated,

Plaintiffs,

v.

OFFICE OF THE COMMISSIONER OF
BASEBALL, et al.

Defendants.

12-cv-3704 (SAS)

ECF Case

Electronically Filed

**DEFENDANTS' JOINT MOTION TO EXCLUDE OPINIONS AND TESTIMONY OF
PLAINTIFFS' EXPERT DR. ROGER G. NOLL**

Pursuant to Rule 702 of the Federal Rules of Evidence and *Daubert v. Merrell Dow Pharmaceuticals, Inc.*, 509 U.S. 579 (1993), the Defendants in the above-captioned actions hereby move for an Order excluding the opinions and testimony of Plaintiffs' expert Dr. Roger G. Noll. The grounds for this motion are set forth in the Defendants' Memorandum of Law and

are further supported by the Declarations of Dr. Ariel Pakes and Dr. Daniel L. McFadden, being submitted herewith. Defendants respectfully request oral argument on their motion.

Dated: November 12, 2014

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Shepard Goldfein

Shepard Goldfein
James A. Keyte
Paul M. Eckles
Matthew M. Martino
Elliot A. Silver
**SKADDEN, ARPS, SLATE,
MEAGHER & FLOM LLP**
Four Times Square
New York, New York 10036-6522
Telephone: (212) 735-3000
Facsimile: (212) 735-2000
shepard.goldfein@skadden.com
james.keyte@skadden.com
paul.eckles@skadden.com
matthew.martino@skadden.com
elliot.silver@skadden.com

*Attorneys for Defendants National Hockey League,
NHL Enterprises, L.P., NHL Interactive
Cyberenterprises, LLC, Chicago Blackhawks
Hockey Team, Inc., Comcast-Spectacor, L.P.,
Hockey Western New York LLC, Lemieux Group,
L.P., Lincoln Hockey LLC, New Jersey Devils LLC,
New York Islanders Hockey Club, L.P. and San
Jose Sharks, LLC*

/s/ Stephen R. Neuwirth

Stephen R. Neuwirth
Richard I. Werder, Jr.
**QUINN EMANUEL URQUHART &
SULLIVAN, LLP**

/s/ Bradley I. Ruskin

Bradley I. Ruskin
Jennifer R. Scullion
Colin Kass
Jordan Leader
Adrian Fontecilla
Stephen Ahron
Joelle Milov
PROSKAUER ROSE LLP
Eleven Times Square
New York, New York 10036-8299
Telephone: (212) 969-3000
Facsimile: (212) 969-2900
bruskin@proskauer.com
jscullion@proskauer.com

Thomas J. Ostertag
Senior Vice President and General Counsel
Office of the Commission of Baseball
245 Park Avenue
New York, New York 10167
Telephone: (212) 931-7855
Facsimile: (212) 949-5653

*Attorneys for Defendants Office of the
Commissioner of Baseball, Major League
Baseball Enterprises Inc., MLB Advanced Media
L.P., MLB Advanced Media, Inc., Athletics
Investment Group, LLC, The Baseball Club of
Seattle, L.L.P., Chicago White Sox, Ltd.,
Colorado Rockies Baseball Club, Ltd., The
Phillies, Pittsburgh Baseball, Inc., and San
Francisco Baseball Associates, L.P.*

/s/ Jonathan D. Schiller

Jonathan D. Schiller
Alan Vickery
Christopher Duffy
BOIES, SCHILLER & FLEXNER LLP

51 Madison Avenue, 22nd Floor
New York, New York 10010
Telephone: (212) 849-7000
Facsimile: (212) 849-7100
stephennewirth@quinnemanuel.com
rickwerder@quinnemanuel.com

*Attorneys for Defendants The Madison Square
Garden Company and New York Rangers Hockey
Club*

/s/ Louis A. Karasik

Louis A. Karasik
Andrew E. Paris
Stephanie A. Jones
ALSTON & BIRD LLP
333 South Hope Street, 16th Floor
Los Angeles, California 90071-3004
Telephone: (213) 576-1000
Facsimile: (213) 576-1100
lou.karasik@alston.com
drew.paris@alston.com
stephanie.jones@alston.com

*Attorneys for Defendants DIRECTV, LLC,
DIRECTV Sports Networks, LLC, DIRECTV Sports
Net Pittsburgh, LLC a/k/a Root Sports Pittsburgh,
DIRECTV Sports Net Rocky Mountain, LLC a/k/a
Root Sports Rocky Mountain, and DIRECTV Sports
Net Northwest, LLC a/k/a Root Sports Northwest*

/s/ Beth A. Wilkinson

Beth A. Wilkinson
Samantha P. Bateman
**PAUL, WEISS, RIFKIND WHARTON &
GARRISON LLP**
2001 K St. NW
Washington, D.C. 20006-1047
Telephone: (202)-223-7300
Facsimile: (202)-223-7420
bwilkinson@paulweiss.com
sbateman@paulweiss.com

*Attorneys for Defendant Yankees
Entertainment & Sports Network, LLC*

575 Lexington Avenue
New York, New York 10022
Telephone: (212) 446-2300
Facsimile: (212) 446-2350
jschiller@bsflfp.com
avickery@bsflfp.com
cduffy@bsflfp.com

*Attorneys for Defendants New York Yankees
Partnership*

/s/ Arthur J. Burke

Arthur J. Burke
David B. Toscano
James W. Haldin
DAVIS POLK & WARDWELL LLP
450 Lexington Avenue
New York, New York 10017
Telephone: (212) 450-4000
Facsimile: (212) 701-5800
arthur.burke@davispolk.com
david.toscano@davispolk.com
james.haldin@davispolk.com

*Attorneys for Defendants Comcast Corporation,
Comcast SportsNet Philadelphia, L.P., Comcast
SportsNet Mid-Atlantic L.P., Comcast SportsNet
California, LLC, and Comcast SportsNet
Chicago, LLC*