

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
DISTRICT OF OREGON  
PORTLAND DIVISION**

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION,  
STATE OF ARIZONA,  
STATE OF CALIFORNIA,  
DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA,  
STATE OF ILLINOIS,  
STATE OF MARYLAND,  
STATE OF NEVADA,  
STATE OF NEW MEXICO,  
STATE OF OREGON, and  
STATE OF WYOMING,

Plaintiffs,

v.

THE KROGER COMPANY and  
ALBERTSONS COMPANIES, INC.,

Defendants.

Case No.: 3:24-cv-00347-AN

**STIPULATION AND ORDER  
REGARDING THE SCOPE OF THE  
RECORD**

WHEREAS Plaintiffs Federal Trade Commission and the States of Arizona, California, Illinois, Maryland, Nevada, New Mexico, Oregon, and Wyoming and the District of Columbia, by and through their respective attorneys general (“Plaintiffs”) and Defendants The Kroger Co. and Albertsons Companies, Inc. (“Defendants”) have agreed to the terms of this Stipulation and Order Regarding the Scope of the Record (“Stipulation”). Plaintiffs and Defendants (together, the “Parties and each a “Party”) agree that this Stipulation shall apply to the admissibility of documents following the conclusion of the evidentiary hearing on Plaintiffs’ motion for preliminary injunction

[PROPOSED] ORDER RE: SCOPE OF THE RECORD

(“Evidentiary Hearing”) and resolves the Parties’ dispute regarding the admissibility of the scope of the administrative record in this proceeding. (ECF Nos. 274, 276.)

WHEREAS the Parties therefore are entering into this Stipulation with the request that the Court enter it as an Order.

NOW THEREFORE, it is hereby STIPULATED and ORDERED:

Following the conclusion of the Evidentiary Hearing, each Party may seek to offer into evidence a reasonable number of exhibits in support of that Party’s proposed findings of fact (“Post-Hearing Exhibits”). The Parties shall retain all rights to object to the admission of any Post-Hearing Exhibits, which shall be resolved by the following process:

1. A Party intending to seek to offer into evidence any Post-Hearing Exhibits must disclose them to the opposing Party no later than three calendar days before the deadline to file their respective proposed findings of fact, which under the Case Management and Scheduling Order is ten days after the Evidentiary Hearing concludes. (ECF No. 88 at 19.)

2. The Parties shall meet and confer to attempt to resolve any objections to Post-Hearing Exhibits before filing their proposed findings of fact.

3. On the same date the Parties file proposed findings of fact, they shall also file:

i. A joint list of the Post-Hearing Exhibits they agree are admissible.

ii. A joint list of the Post-Hearing Exhibits they seek to offer in support of their proposed findings of fact, but to which at least one Party maintains an objection.

This list shall identify the Party seeking to offer the exhibit and the Party maintaining the objection, and contain a brief explanation of the basis for the objection.

[PROPOSED] ORDER RE: SCOPE OF THE RECORD

iii. Separate briefs, not to exceed five pages each for Plaintiffs and Defendants, with any arguments related to the remaining objections.

Dated: August 26, 2024

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Susan A. Musser

Susan A. Musser, DC Bar # 1531486  
Rohan Pai, DC Bar # 1015652  
Charles Dickinson, DC Bar # 997153  
Laura Hall, NY Bar # 4337408  
Barrett Anderson, CA Bar # 318539

Federal Trade Commission  
Bureau of Competition  
600 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
Washington, DC 20580  
Telephone: (202) 326-2122  
smusser@ftc.gov

*Attorneys for Plaintiff Federal Trade Commission*

/s/ Robert A. Bernheim

Robert A. Bernheim, AZ Bar No. 024664

Jayne L. Weber, AZ Bar No. 032608

Vinny Venkat, AZ Bar No. 038587

Connor Nolan, AZ Bar No. 038088

Arizona Office of the Attorney General

2005 N. Central Avenue

Phoenix, AZ 85004

Telephone: (602) 542-5025

Robert.Bernheim@azag.gov

Jayne.Weber@azag.gov

Vinny.Venkat@azag.gov

Connor.Nolan@azag.gov

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Arizona*

[PROPOSED] ORDER RE: SCOPE OF THE RECORD

/s/ Nicole Gordon

---

Nicole Gordon, CA Bar No. 224138  
Shira Hoffman, CA Bar No. 337659

State of California  
California Department of Justice  
455 Golden Gate Ave., Suite 11000  
San Francisco, CA 94102  
Telephone: (415) 510-3458  
Facsimile: (415) 703-5480  
Nicole.Gordon@doj.ca.gov  
Shira.Hoffman@doj.ca.gov

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of California*

[PROPOSED] ORDER RE: SCOPE OF THE RECORD

/s/ C. William Margrabe

---

C. William Margrabe, DC Bar No. 90013916

Office of the Attorney General for the District of  
Columbia

400 6th Street, N.W, 10th Floor

Washington, D.C. 20001

Telephone: (202) 727-3400

Will.Margrabe@dc.gov

*Attorneys for Plaintiff District of Columbia*

[PROPOSED] ORDER RE: SCOPE OF THE RECORD

/s/ Brian M. Yost

---

Brian M. Yost, IL Bar No. 6334138  
Paul J. Harper, IL Bar No. 6335001  
Alice Riechers, IL Bar No. 6272933

Office of the Illinois Attorney General  
115 S. LaSalle St.  
Chicago, IL 60603  
Telephone: (872) 276-3598  
Email: Brian.Yost@ilag.gov  
Paul.Harper@ilag.gov  
Alice.Riechers@ilag.gov

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Illinois*

[PROPOSED] ORDER RE: SCOPE OF THE RECORD

/s/ Schonette J. Walker

---

Schonette J. Walker, MD Bar No. 0512290008

Gary Honick, MD Bar No. 7806010078

Byron Warren, MD Bar No. 1612140330

Office of the Attorney General

200 St. Paul Place, 19th Floor

Baltimore, MD 21202

Telephone: (410) 576-6470

swalker@oag.state.md.us

ghonick@oag.state.md.us

bwarren@oag.state.md.us

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Maryland*

[PROPOSED] ORDER RE: SCOPE OF THE RECORD



/s/ Lucas J. Tucker

---

Lucas J. Tucker, NV Bar No. 10252

Samantha B. Feeley, NV Bar No. 14034

Office of the Nevada Attorney General

100 N. Carson St.

Carson City, Nevada 89701

Telephone: (775) 684-1100

ltucker@ag.nv.gov

sfeeley@ag.nv.gov

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Nevada*

[PROPOSED] ORDER RE: SCOPE OF THE RECORD

/s/ Julie Ann Meade

Julie Ann Meade, NM Bar No. 8143  
Jeff Dan Herrera, NM Bar No. 154030

New Mexico Department of Justice  
408 Galisteo St.  
Santa Fe, NM 87504  
Telephone: (505) 717-3500  
jmeade@nmag.gov  
jherrera@nmag.gov

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of New Mexico*

[PROPOSED] ORDER RE: SCOPE OF THE RECORD

/s/ Cheryl F. Hiemstra

---

Cheryl F. Hiemstra, OSB#133857

Tim D. Nord, OSB#882800

Chris Kayser, OSB#984244

Tania Manners, OSB#140363

Oregon Department of Justice

100 SW Market Street

Portland, OR 97201

Telephone: (503) 934-4400

Facsimile: (503) 378-5017

Cheryl.Hiemstra@doj.state.or.us

Tim.D.Nord@doj.state.or.us

cjkayser@lvklaw.com

tmanners@lvklaw.com

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Oregon*

[PROPOSED] ORDER RE: SCOPE OF THE RECORD

/s/ William Young

William Young, WY Bar No. 8-6746

Office of the Wyoming Attorney General

109 State Capitol

Cheyenne, WY 82002

Telephone: (307) 777-7847

William.Young@wyo.gov

*Attorney for Plaintiff State of Wyoming*

[PROPOSED] ORDER RE: SCOPE OF THE RECORD

STOEL RIVES LLP

/s/ B. John Casey

B. JOHN CASEY, OSB No. 120025

john.casey@stoel.com

RACHEL C. LEE, OSB No. 102944

rachel.lee@stoel.com

JACOB GOLDBERG, OSB No. 162565

jacob.goldberg@stoel.com

AND

ARNOLD & PORTER KAYE SCHOLER LLP

MATTHEW M. WOLF (*Pro Hac Vice*)

matthew.wolf@arnoldporter.com

SONIA K. PFAFFENROTH (*Pro Hac Vice*)

sonia.pfaffenroth@arnoldporter.com

JOSHUA M. DAVIS (*Pro Hac Vice*)

joshua.davis@arnoldporter.com

KOLYA D. GLICK (*Pro Hac Vice*)

kolya.glick@arnoldporter.com

JASON C. EWART (*Pro Hac Vice*)

jason.ewart@arnoldporter.com

MICHAEL E. KIENTZLE (*Pro Hac Vice*)

michael.kientzle@arnoldporter.com

MATTHEW M. SHULTZ (*Pro Hac Vice*)

matthew.shultz@arnoldporter.com

DAVID B. BERGMAN (*Pro Hac Vice*)

david.bergman@arnoldporter.com

MICHAEL L. WALDEN (*Pro Hac Vice*)

mike.walden@arnoldporter.com

YASMINE L. HARIK (*Pro Hac Vice*)

yasmine.harik@arnoldporter.com

ALLISON GARDNER (*Pro Hac Vice*)

allison.gardner@arnoldporter.com

BARBARA H. WOOTTON (*Pro Hac Vice*)

barbara.wootton@arnoldporter.com

CHRISTIAN SCHULTZ (*Pro Hac Vice*)

christian.schultz@arnoldporter.com

DAVID EMANUELSON (*Pro Hac Vice*)

david.emanuelson@arnoldporter.com

MEI-WAH LEE (*Pro Hac Vice*)

[PROPOSED] ORDER RE: SCOPE OF THE RECORD

mei-wah.lee@arnoldporter.com  
WILSON DELOSS MUDGE (*Pro Hac Vice*)  
wilson.mudge@arnoldporter.com  
601 Massachusetts Avenue, NW  
Washington, DC 20001  
Telephone: 202.942.5000

JOHN A. HOLLER (*Pro Hac Vice*)  
john.holler@arnoldporter.com  
250 W 55th Street  
New York, NY 10019  
Telephone: 212.836.8000

BRIAN K. CONDON (*Pro Hac Vice*)  
brian.condon@arnoldporter.com  
777 S. Figueroa Street, 44th Floor  
Los Angeles, CA 90017  
Telephone: 213.243.4000

JEREMY T. KAMRAS (*Pro Hac Vice*)  
jeremy.kamras@arnoldporter.com  
Three Embarcadero Center, 10th Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94111  
Telephone: 415.471.3100

AND

WEIL, GOTSHAL & MANGES LLP

MARK A. PERRY (*Pro Hac Vice*)  
mark.perry@weil.com  
LUKE SULLIVAN (*Pro Hac Vice*)  
luke.sullivan@weil.com  
JASON N. KLEINWAKS (*Pro Hac Vice*)  
jason.kleinwaks@weil.com  
2001 M Street, NW, Suite 600  
Washington, DC 20036  
Telephone: 202.682.7000

LUNA N. BARRINGTON (*Pro Hac Vice*)  
luna.barrington@weil.com  
767 Fifth Avenue  
New York, NY 10153  
Telephone: 212.310.8000

[PROPOSED] ORDER RE: SCOPE OF THE RECORD

SARAH M. STERNLIEB (*Pro Hac Vice*)  
sarah.sternlieb@weil.com  
700 Louisiana Street, Suite 3700  
Houston, TX 77002  
Telephone: 713.546.5000

BAMBO OBARO (*Pro Hac Vice*)  
bambo.obaro@weil.com  
201 Redwood Shores Parkway  
Redwood Shores, CA 94065  
Telephone: 650.802.3000

THOMAS B. FIASCONE (*Pro Hac Vice*)  
tom.fiascone@weil.com  
REBECCA SIVITZ (*Pro Hac Vice*)  
rebecca.sivitz@weil.com  
100 Federal Street, Floor 34  
Boston, MA 02110  
Telephone: 617.722.8314

*Attorneys for Defendant The Kroger Company*

ANGELI LAW GROUP LLC

/s/ David H. Angeli  
DAVID H. ANGELI, Bar No. 020244  
david@angelilaw.com  
PETER D. HAWKES, Bar No. 071986  
peter@angelilaw.com  
121 SW Morrison Street, Suite 400  
Portland, OR 97204  
Telephone: 503.954.2232

AND

DEBEVOISE & PLIMPTON LLP

EDWARD D. HASSI (*Pro Hac Vice*)  
thassi@debevoise.com  
801 Pennsylvania Avenue NW  
Washington, DC 20004  
Telephone: 202.942.5000

[PROPOSED] ORDER RE: SCOPE OF THE RECORD

MICHAEL SCHAPER (*Pro Hac Vice*)  
mschaper@debevoise.com  
SHANNON ROSE SELDEN (*Pro Hac Vice*)  
srselden@debevoise.com  
J. ROBERT ABRAHAM (*Pro Hac Vice*)  
jrabraham@debevoise.com  
NATASCHA BORN (*Pro Hac Vice*)  
nborn@debevoise.com  
66 Hudson Boulevard  
New York, NY 10001  
Telephone: 212.909.6000

AND

WILLIAMS & CONNOLLY LLP

ENU A. MAINIGI (*Pro Hac Vice*)  
emainigi@wc.com  
JONATHAN B. PITT (*Pro Hac Vice*)  
jpitt@wc.com  
A. JOSHUA PODOLL (*Pro Hac Vice*)  
apodoll@wc.com  
THOMAS W. RYAN (*Pro Hac Vice*)  
tryan@wc.com  
TYLER INFINGER (*Pro Hac Vice*)  
tinfinger@wc.com  
WILLIAM ASHWORTH (*Pro Hac Vice*)  
washworth@wc.com  
680 Maine Avenue SW  
Washington, DC 20024  
Telephone: 202.434.5000

AND

DECHERT LLP

JAMES A. FISHKIN (*Pro Hac Vice*)  
james.fishkin@dechert.com  
MICHAEL COWIE (*Pro Hac Vice*)  
mike.cowie@dechert.com  
ELENA KAMENIR (*Pro Hac Vice*)  
elena.kamenir@dechert.com  
1900 K Street NW

[PROPOSED] ORDER RE: SCOPE OF THE RECORD



Washington, DC 20006  
Telephone: 202.261.3300

HOWARD. M. ULLMAN (*Pro Hac Vice*)  
howard.ullman@dechert.com  
45 Fremont St, 26th Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94105  
Telephone: 415.262.4500

ROSS UFBERG (*Pro Hac Vice*)  
ross.ufberg@dechert.com  
YOSEF WEITZMAN (*Pro Hac Vice*)  
yosi.weitzman@dechert.com  
Cira Centre  
2929 Arch Street  
Philadelphia, PA 19104  
Telephone: 215.994.2422

*Attorneys for Defendant Albertsons Companies, Inc.*

SO ORDERED:

August \_\_\_\_\_, 2024

---

UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

[PROPOSED] ORDER RE: SCOPE OF THE RECORD